UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

Criminal Action
No. 13-10200-GAO

DZHOKHAR A. TSARNAEV, also
known as Jahar Tsarni,

Defendant.

BEFORE THE HONORABLE GEORGE A. O'TOOLE, JR. UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

## JURY TRIAL - DAY FORTY-SEVEN

John J. Moakley United States Courthouse
Courtroom No. 9
One Courthouse Way
Boston, Massachusetts 02210
Tuesday, April 21, 2015
10:08 a.m.

Marcia G. Patrisso, RMR, CRR
Official Court Reporter
John J. Moakley U.S. Courthouse
One Courthouse Way, Room 3510
Boston, Massachusetts 02210
(617) 737-8728

Mechanical Steno - Computer-Aided Transcript

```
1
     APPEARANCES:
          OFFICE OF THE UNITED STATES ATTORNEY
 2
          By: William D. Weinreb, Aloke Chakravarty and
 3
              Nadine Pellegrini, Assistant U.S. Attorneys
          John Joseph Moakley Federal Courthouse
          Suite 9200
 4
          Boston, Massachusetts 02210
 5
          - and -
          UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
 6
          By: Steven D. Mellin, Assistant U.S. Attorney
          Capital Case Section
 7
          1331 F Street, N.W.
          Washington, D.C. 20530
 8
          On Behalf of the Government
          FEDERAL PUBLIC DEFENDER OFFICE
 9
          By: Miriam Conrad, William W. Fick and Timothy G. Watkins,
10
              Federal Public Defenders
          51 Sleeper Street
          Fifth Floor
11
          Boston, Massachusetts 02210
          - and -
12
          CLARKE & RICE, APC
13
          By: Judy Clarke, Esq.
          1010 Second Avenue
14
          Suite 1800
          San Diego, California
15
          - and -
          LAW OFFICE OF DAVID I. BRUCK
16
          By: David I. Bruck, Esq.
          220 Sydney Lewis Hall
          Lexington, Virginia 24450
17
          On Behalf of the Defendant
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

	I N D E X			
WITNESSES FOR THE GOVERNMENT:	Direct	Cross	Redirect	Recross
CELESTE CORCORAN				
By Mr. Mellin	34			
GILLIAN RENY				
By Mr. Chakravarty	71			
WILLIAM CAMPBELL III,				
By Ms. Pellegrini	87			
WILLIAM A. CAMPBELL, JR.				
By Ms. Pellegrini	107			
NICOLE GROSS				
By Mr. Mellin	119			
		<b>a</b>		
<u>t.                                    </u>	XHIBIT	<u>5</u>		
GOVERNMENT'S EXHIBIT DESCRIPTION		EOD	TD	RECEIVED
		FOR	<u>ID</u>	KECEIVED
1601, 1601-03,				
1601-04, 1601-15,				
1601-17, 1601-19,				
1601-21, 1601-24,				
1601-28 Photographs				101
1594 Photograph				41
1449 Photograph				61
1632 Photograph				83

1		EXHIBITS (cont'd)				
2	GOVERNMENT'S					
3	EXHIBIT S	DESCRIPTION	FOR ID RECEIVED			
4	1601-01, 1601-02,					
5	1601-07, 1601-08,					
6	1601-09, 1601-12,					
7	1601-14	Photographs	114			
8	1601-10	Replacing Exhibit No. 1601-14	119			
9	1619	Photograph	123			
10	1620	Photograph	128			
11	19	Photograph	133			
12						
13	ODENING INST	OPENING INSTRUCTIONS BY THE COURTPAGE 5				
14						
15	OPENING STATEMENT BY MS. PELLEGRINI					
16						
17						
18						
19						
20						
21						
22						
23						
24						
25						

1 PROCEEDINGS 2 THE CLERK: All rise for the Court and the jury. 3 (The Court and jury enter the courtroom at 10:08 a.m.) THE CLERK: Be seated. 4 5 THE COURT: Good morning, jurors. 6 THE JURORS: Good morning. 7 THE COURT: Welcome back. THE JURORS: Thank you. 8 9 THE COURT: I must ask you: Have you all been able to 00:08 10 abide by my instructions to avoid any publicity about the case? 11 THE JURORS: Yes, your Honor. THE COURT: Yes? And any communications with anybody 12 13 about the circumstances or the substance of the case? 14 THE JURORS: Yes. 15 THE COURT: Anybody have anything they want to mention to me privately at all that arose? No? Okay. 16 Well, jurors, as you know, you have unanimously found 17 18 the defendant quilty of all the counts contained in the 19 indictment. Seventeen of those counts are capital counts, by 00:08 20 which I mean that the death penalty is a possible punishment 21 for those offenses. Those counts are Counts 1 through 10 and 22 Counts 12 through 18. 23 Substantively, those counts are, in summary, 24 conspiracy to use a weapon of mass destruction resulting in 25 death, use of a weapon of mass destruction resulting in death,

00:10 20

00:09 10

conspiracy to bomb a place of public use resulting in death, bombing a place of public use resulting in death, malicious destruction of property resulting in injury and death, and possession and use of a firearm during and in relation to a crime of violence resulting in death.

We're now about to begin the penalty phase of the trial where you must consider separately with regard to each of the capital counts whether imposition of a sentence of death is the appropriate sentence for that conviction or whether the defendant, Dzhokhar Tsarnaev, should be sentenced to life imprisonment without the possibility of release.

As I have previously told you, the law leaves this sentencing decision exclusively to you, the jury. If you determine that the defendant should be sentenced to death or that he should be sentenced to life imprisonment without the possibility of release, the Court is required to impose that sentence. You should understand that there is no parole in the federal system.

The penalty phase is essentially a second trial, and in many ways is like the trial you have just completed on the issue of guilt, although now the sole issue for your consideration is punishment. You should understand that in making all the determinations you're required to make in this phase of the trial, you may consider any and all evidence that was presented during the guilt phase of the trial as well as

the additional information that will be presented in this penalty phase.

Just as in the first trial, during the course of the penalty phase I'll anticipate that you will again see the attorneys sometimes make objections to the introduction of certain evidence, and I will rule on those objections as they arise. Please remember, as before, that when I sustain an objection, meaning that I agree the evidence called for should not be given, the witness won't answer the question.

If that's the case, then don't try to answer it yourselves. Don't try to guess what the answer might have been if it were given. Just take it that for whatever reason there's no answer to that question, and the question itself is now irrelevant. Wait for the next question and the answer to that because it's the witness's answers that supply the evidence, not the lawyers' questions. Unanswered questions produce no evidence for your consideration no matter how much they may suggest some.

Similarly, if I overrule the objection, the witness will go ahead and answer the question. That answer becomes part of the evidence. It is — along with all the other evidence that you'll have to evaluate, it doesn't have any special meaning or significance because there was an answer given after an objection had been made.

The structure will be similar to the form we followed.

00:11 10

00:11 20

00:13 20

00:12 10

We'll begin when I'm finished with these preliminary remarks with the government's opening statement. A defendant in a case like this always has the opportunity to make an opening statement but may elect whether to make it immediately following the government's opening, or later on at the commencement of the defense presentation of evidence, and in this case the defendant has elected the second course, so that the defendant's opening statement will actually be made just prior to the beginning of the defendant's presentation of evidence, which will be next week. Next Monday is when we'll begin that part.

So after the government makes its opening statement, then the witnesses will again be called and examined and cross-examined. Exhibits will be shown and admitted. And then when it's all done, after the defendant's case has been presented and you've been instructed again and had another round of closing arguments, you'll begin to deliberate on the issues presented in this phase of the case.

The final instructions I will give will be more complete than these that I give you now, but I want to give you some guidance as to how we'll proceed in the next several days and weeks, perhaps.

Now, obviously it is impossible for me to overstate the importance of the decision before you or the careful and thorough consideration you should give to this matter. I

00:14 20

00:14 10

remind you that at the time you were selected as jurors, each of you assured me that if this case required a capital punishment hearing, you would be open-minded as to the possible punishment. When you took your oath as jurors, you swore that you would give a true verdict according to the law and the evidence. It is imperative that you keep that promise.

Congress has assigned to juries the decision whether a defendant convicted of a capital crime should be sentenced to death or to life imprisonment; however, before the death penalty can be considered by you for any capital count of conviction, you must first make three important findings unanimously and beyond a reasonable doubt.

A sentence of death on a particular capital count may be considered if, and only if, you made the following three findings unanimously and beyond a reasonable doubt with respect to that count: First, you must find unanimously and beyond a reasonable doubt that the defendant was 18 years of age or older at the time of the offense charged in that count; second, for each of the capital counts, you must find unanimously and beyond a reasonable doubt that one or more of the following four propositions has been proven. I may sometimes refer to these propositions as "gateway elements" or "factors."

The first is that the defendant intentionally killed the victim or victims of the particular capital offense charged in the respective count of the indictment under consideration;

respective count of the indictment;

00:16 20

00:15 10

Or, second, that the defendant intentionally inflicted serious bodily injury that resulted in the death of the victim or victims of the particular capital offense charged in the

Or that the defendant intentionally participated in an act or acts contemplating that the life of a person or persons would be taken, or intending that lethal force would be used in connection with a person or persons other than one of the participants in the offense, and that the victim or victims of the particular capital offense charged in the particular count of the indictment died as a result of the acts;

Or, fourth, that the defendant intentionally and specifically engaged in an act or acts of violence knowing that the acts created a grave risk of death to a person or persons other than one of the participants in the offense such that participation in the acts constituted a reckless disregard for human life, and the victim or victims of the particular capital offense charged in the respective count of the indictment died as a result of those acts.

So the government must prove at least one of those four propositions beyond a reasonable doubt.

Now, before I get to the third thing that must be proved unanimously and beyond a reasonable doubt before the death penalty can be considered, let me pause to define for you two terms that you have heard and will hear throughout the

00:18 20

00:17 10

phase of the trial: "aggravating factors" and "mitigating factors." You heard a little bit about these concepts during the process of jury selection.

In general, these factors relate to the circumstances of the crime or the personal traits, character or background of the defendant. The word "aggravate" means to make worse or more offensive, or to intensify; the word "mitigate" means to make less severe or to moderate. An aggravating factor, therefore, is a fact or circumstance that would tend to support imposition of the death penalty.

As I will explain, aggravating factors may be either statutory, meaning they are specified as aggravating factors in the death penalty statute, or non-statutory, meaning they are factors not specified in the statute but alleged by the government to be aggravating factors in this case.

A mitigating factor is any aspect of the defendant's character or background, any circumstances of the offenses, or any other relevant fact or circumstance that would tend to indicate that the defendant should not be sentenced to death.

Having said that, now, the third threshold, or gateway finding, that you must make unanimously and beyond a reasonable doubt before you may consider imposition of a death sentence is that the government has proved the existence of at least one statutory aggravating factor. As I say, a statutory aggravating factor is an aggravating factor that is

00:19 20

00:19 10

specifically set forth as such in the death penalty statute and which has been identified in this case by the government for your consideration.

The government alleges the following statutory aggravating factors stated in summary form -- alleges that they exist with regard to particular counts and in some cases all of the capital counts. So these are the statutory aggravating factors that the government alleges:

First, the death of the person identified in a particular count under consideration occurred during the defendant's commission of a crime other than the crime charged in that particular count; second, the defendant knowingly created a grave risk of death to one or more persons in addition to the deceased victim of the offense; third, the defendant committed the offense in an especially heinous, cruel and depraved manner; fourth, that the defendant committed the offense after substantial planning and premeditation to cause the death of a person or to commit an act of terrorism; fifth, the defendant intentionally killed or attempted to kill more than one person in a single criminal episode; sixth, the defendant is responsible for the death of a victim who was particularly vulnerable due to youth.

In summary, then, if after fair and impartial consideration of all the evidence in this case you unanimously find the government has proved beyond a reasonable doubt that

00:21 20

00:20 10

the defendant was at least 18 years of age and at least one of the gateway factors about intent and at least one of the statutory aggravating factors with regard to that particular capital count, then you will proceed to the next stage of your analysis.

If, however, you find with regard to a particular capital count that the defendant was not at least 18 years old or that no gateway factor had been proved beyond a reasonable doubt or that no statutory aggravating factor had been proved beyond a reasonable doubt, then your deliberations will be over as to that count, and for that count the Court will impose a sentence of life imprisonment without the possibility of release.

If you proceed to the next stage of your analysis, you will consider whether you unanimously find that the government has proven beyond a reasonable doubt the existence of any non-statutory aggravating factor. Those are factors other than those set out in the death penalty statute which have been specifically alleged by the government for consideration in this case. The government alleges several non-statutory aggravating factors. And again, any finding that a non-statutory aggravating factor exists must be unanimous and beyond a reasonable doubt.

After your consideration of the non-statutory aggravating factors, then you will consider and decide whether

00:22 10

00:22 20

the defendant has shown the existence of any mitigating factors. There are some important distinctions that I want to highlight for you with respect to the proof of mitigating factors. The defendant has the burden of proving any mitigating factors by the preponderance of the evidence. The defendant is not required to prove the existence of a mitigating factor beyond a reasonable doubt, which is a burden of proof the government has with respect to aggravating factors.

The defendant need only establish the existence of a mitigating factor by a preponderance of the evidence, that is, by the greater weight of the evidence. Put another way, you need only be convinced that it is more likely true than not in order to find that the mitigating factor exists.

Importantly, a unanimous finding is not required as to the existence of any mitigating factor. Any juror individually or independently may find the existence of a mitigating factor regardless of the number of other jurors who may agree. A juror who so finds may consider that factor in weighing the evidence as a whole. In other words, if any member of the jury finds that a mitigating factor has been proved, that juror may weigh that factor in making up his or her mind whether or not to vote to impose the death sentence as opposed to life in prison as to any of the capital counts.

After you've considered and decided what aggravating

00:24 20

00:23 10

factors and what mitigating factors have been proved, you will then consider whether any proven aggravating factor or factors, both statutory and non-statutory, outweigh any mitigating factor or factors that you individually, or with other jurors, have found to exist.

After weighing the aggravating and any mitigating factors, the jury must consider whether all the aggravating factor or factors found to exist sufficiently outweigh all the mitigating factor or factors found to exist to justify a sentence of death, or in the absence of a mitigating factor, whether the aggravating factor or factors alone are sufficient to justify a sentence of death.

In carrying out this weighing and balancing process, jurors are called upon to make a unique, individualized judgment about the appropriateness of sentencing another human being to death. This is not a mechanical process. Neither is the decision determined by the number of aggravating or mitigating factors considered in the balance.

Jurors should consider such factors qualitatively, assessing the weight and significance that should be given to each factor. For example, one aggravating factor, if sufficiently serious, may outweigh several mitigating factors. By the same token, a single mitigating factor may outweigh several aggravating factors. In short, what is called for in weighing the various factors is not arithmetic but an

00:26 20

00:25 10

individual juror's careful, considered and reasoned judgment.

Again, whether or not the circumstances in the case justify a sentence of death is a decision the law leaves entirely to you, and you should not take that anything I may say or do during this phase of the trial, or have said or done in the prior phase, as indicating in any way what I think of the evidence or what I think your verdict should be.

As I mentioned, you must deliberate and determine a sentence for each of the capital counts separately. You may conclude the aggravating and mitigating factors should receive different weights in conducting the separate weighing of aggravating and mitigating factors applicable to each of the capital counts. In other words, a decision about one count does not mean you have to make the same decision about any other count. You may or you may not as you determine as appropriate and just.

There are several final points I want to make and emphasize. The first that I mentioned briefly is that you are never required to return a verdict of death. The law provides you with guidance in making a decision, but as stated earlier, your decision on whether this question of life or death is an individual -- your decision on this question of life or death is an individual judgment which the law in the final analysis leaves up to each of you. And as you've heard, in order to impose a sentence of death, all 12 jurors must agree that death

is the appropriate sentence.

00:27 20

00:27 10

I also want to draw your attention to a unique aspect of capital cases. At the end of this case, along with the other detailed instructions that you'll have that apply to the sentencing decision, I will include an instruction along the following lines: In your consideration of whether to impose the death sentence or life imprisonment without the possibility of release, you must not consider the race, color, religious beliefs, national origin or sex of either the defendant or the victims. You are not to return a sentence of death unless you would return a sentence of death for the crime in question without regard to the race, color, religious beliefs, national origin or sex of either the defendant or any victim.

When they passed the Federal Death Penalty statute, Congress considered this non-discrimination principle to be so important that it created a special procedure for it. When you have completed your deliberations and have reached a verdict, you will each be asked to sign a certificate swearing that you have followed that instruction, that non-discrimination instruction, in your sentencing determination. You won't get to the form, of course, until the end of the sentencing process, but I wanted you to know about it so you can keep it in mind throughout the hearing while you listen to the evidence.

Let me highlight one last aspect of the case before we

00:29 20

00:28 10

begin: During the course of the sentencing proceeding the government will be introducing what is known as victim-impact evidence. Victim-impact evidence is evidence about the deceased person's personal characteristics and the impact of their deaths upon their families and on others. The government has provided notice that it intends to present such evidence to show the injury, harm and loss caused by each of the victim's deaths.

You must be careful not to permit this evidence to cause you to sentence the defendant simply out of sympathy with the victims or the family members. Such sympathy may be natural, even unavoidable, but it cannot be the basis for your sentencing decision. Your decision must be a reasoned moral response to the evidence before you concerning all the circumstances of the offenses and the defendant's own background, character and record. Your decision must not be simply an emotional response to the victim-impact evidence or a way to express sympathy with or support for the victim's families.

I also caution you you should not be influenced by speculation concerning what sentence you think anyone else, including the victims's families, might wish to see imposed on the defendant. You have been selected to decide this case because you committed to be fair and impartial in all respects, and you have made your oath or affirmation to that effect. It

1 is for you alone as fair-minded jurors, who have no friends to reward and no enemies to punish, to decide the appropriate 2 sentence in this case. I will repeat and elaborate on these points after you 4 5 have heard all the evidence and before you begin your deliberations. As in the prior proceedings, you'll have a 7 special verdict form to assist you and quide you in your deliberations. But because these procedures are unique to 8 capital cases and so fundamentally important to your 00:30 10 decision-making, I thought it advisable for you to have this 11 preliminary explanation. 12 So thank you for your attention. We're now ready for 13 the government's opening statement. 14 Ms. Pellegrini. 15 MR. WEINREB: Your Honor, we'd ask the jurors to lift 16 their screens. 17 THE COURT: Okay. I guess there will be use of the 18 screens. 19 MS. PELLEGRINI: Good morning. 00:32 20 THE JURORS: Good morning. MS. PELLEGRINI: Unbearable, indescribable, 21 22 inexcusable and senseless. All of those words have been used 23 to describe the murders committed by Dzhokhar Tsarnaev. Yes, 24 the deaths of Krystle Campbell, of Lingzi Lu, of Martin Richard 25 and of Officer Sean Collier have been all of those things for

their families and for their friends.

00:34 20

00:33 10

But don't let those descriptions make you think that you'll never really understand what Dzhokhar Tsarnaev did to those victims and don't think that you won't know the full impact of his crimes, or that you won't be able to comprehend what those murders did to their families, their friends and their colleagues. You will know the story of those four families.

The deaths committed by Dzhokhar Tsarnaev were deliberate, intentional and cruel. You know how Krystle, Lingzi, Martin and Sean died. Now you need to know how they lived. You need to know and understand why their lives mattered. You will begin to know Krystle Campbell and understand what it meant to lose the young woman that her father, Bill Campbell, nicknamed "Princess." You'll hear more about Lingzi, and you will understand what it meant to lose the young woman that her father, Jun Lu, remembered as a jolly girl.

You'll see Martin Richard who so resembles his dad, and see him in photos that will remind you of what an eight-year-old boy's life is like. Should be like. And you will know Sean Collier, the officer who inspired these words spoken to those who mourned him: "Live long, like he would. Big hearts, big smiles, big service. All love."

These young women, this young man and this little boy,

00:37 20

00:36 10

all of them were loved and they loved in return. This is how we should know them, because they weren't always just the victims of Dzhokhar Tsarnaev. Before he murdered them in some of the cruellest ways imaginable, they were sons, they were daughters, they were grandchildren, they were brothers and they were sisters. And all of them had rich and fulfilling lives even at their young age.

But now these beautiful faces are memories and memorials. They're symbols, even, of loss, when all their families would want is to have them back one more time to be their son, their daughter, their best friend. When all they want is to have them come home one more time. For Lingzi, that would mean home to China, as she's pictured here, so that her parents could tell her that they kept their promise, they kept her beloved music collection safe when she left China to travel halfway around the world to come to Boston to study.

One more time just to see them laugh and joke, like

Krystle here celebrating after a wedding that she had

successfully planned and pulled off on Spectacle Island. Just

to watch them smile proudly, like Sean here at a family

wedding. And just to see Martin decked out in green beads one

more time for one more St. Patrick's Day.

Their families had every right to expect they would live out their lives and realize the potential of these young lives, but Dzhokhar Tsarnaev took them all away, in the most

00:38 10

00:39 20

painful and brutal ways possible. They were all beautiful, and they're all now gone.

And there are others who, while they survived, found their lives dramatically, irrevocably changed in an instant by Dzhokhar Tsarnaev: Jessica Kensky, Roseann Sdoia, Karen McWatters, Jeff Bauman, Rebekah Gregory. They're just a few of the victim survivors. Roseann, Karen and Rebekah each suffered the amputation of one leg; Jessica and Jeff have now lost both legs. You heard and you saw what they went through, what they suffered through and the terrible injuries inflicted by Dzhokhar Tsarnaev.

And, yes, when they testified, they were brave, they were resilient and they were open. They faced you, as they still face life, with great humor and good grace. But now you need to know the full story of all of them, of all of the survivors. You need to know how close they came to death as a result of the actions of Dzhokhar Tsarnaev; how close they came and others came, and how close others still might be.

The question of guilt has been answered, and the question of sentence remains. You have heard testimony and you've seen photos and videos; you've heard the graphic descriptions and the wrenching testimony of the victims and the witnesses. You needed to know all of that evidence because you needed to know what happened on Boylston Street, in Cambridge and in Watertown.

00:40 10

00:40 20

The verdicts don't supply you the answer to the next question that you must answer, but the evidence will assist you. And you could consider everything that you have heard in the guilt phase and everything that you are about to hear in this phase; you'll just look at it in a slightly different way. Because now all of the evidence and all of the information will help to assist you in answering one more question. And we phrase the question as this: Why? Why? After weighing all of the aggravating factors and mitigating factors, why is the death penalty the appropriate and just sentence for Dzhokhar Tsarnaev?

The answer, we suggest, will be found in the entire sum of Dzhokhar Tsarnaev's own character and his own actions. Every gateway factor that the Court mentioned and every aggravating factor will be proven to you beyond a reasonable doubt. Why is the death penalty the appropriate and just sentence? Because Dzhokhar Tsarnaev planned and he plotted to kill. Because when Dzhokhar Tsarnaev sauntered down Boylston Street and took a pressure cooker bomb into the crowds, he created a grave risk of death for every person within a radius of that bomb. And later he created that same risk for every officer and every person in the radius of the bombs that he threw down Laurel Street, and every officer in the range of the car that he gunned down Laurel Street.

Why? Because Dzhokhar Tsarnaev created grave risk of

00:41 10

00:42 20

death for every single one of the 17 victims who had to undergo amputations, many undergoing multiple operations, some undergoing multiple amputations, all of them being put at risk and some still, I'd suggest.

Because in the course of four days he took the lives of these four young, beautiful people. Three died on the streets of Boston, killed by pressure cooker bombs that exploded with such lethal force that pieces of them were embedded in the concrete buildings across the street. Dzhokhar Tsarnaev murdered each one of them in a way that they had time to feel pain, they had time to be scared and frightened, but they had no time to say good-bye. And that is the very essence of terror.

Why? Because Dzhokhar Tsarnaev executed a police officer targeted simply because he was an officer and Dzhokhar Tsarnaev wanted his gun, an officer who sat in his cruiser on that quiet Cambridge campus and died after he was shot between the eyes.

The ultimate question requires you to make a determination, but as the Court just instructed you, you cannot make that final determination until you have made certain gateway findings. So let's look at what you already know and what you will know.

Dzhokhar Tsarnaev was 19 and a half years old when he walked down Boylston Street, just three months shy of his 20th

00:44 20

00:43 10

birthday. He carried a backpack stuffed with a heavy took time to build pressure cooker, itself lined with nails and BBs that would become embedded in the bodies of his victims. He carried a weapon of mass destruction; not simply a random and quick means, an opportunity to commit a crime. It took time to build the bombs. It took time and planning to get Dzhokhar Tsarnaev and the bombs into his hands. It took planning and it took coordination to get him and the bombs to Boylston Street. And quite obviously, his detonation of the bomb seconds after the first blast was carefully coordinated and calculated. You saw the images of Dzhokhar Tsarnaev on his phone at the Forum site. You saw the phone records.

As Dzhokhar Tsarnaev walked with his partner, his coconspirator, his brother, he could see what the Boston Marathon represented in those few blocks, and how could he not see or know the vulnerability of each and every one of those spectators? There he is, a 26.2-mile road race that culminates in the heart of Boston, surrounded -- the course surrounded by well-wishers, celebrants, avid fans and casual observers. The finish line just ahead beckoning thousands of runners. And people stood cheering and ringing bells and clapping and laughing.

And after Tamerlan Tsarnaev walked toward the finish line, Dzhokhar Tsarnaev stood alone at the site of the Forum. He stood alone, but he was in a crowd. His lethal bomb at his

00:46 20

00:45 10

feet represented a grave risk of death and, of course, death for those who died. He stood, he looked, he called his brother and he acted.

After both bombs exploded, three people lay dying, and many people were so badly injured that their limbs were already amputated or shortly would be. And among the deceased was a small eight-year-old boy. Three days later Dzhokhar Tsarnaev shot and killed a police officer. After the carjacking that followed that murder, he tried to murder police officers in Watertown. He threw bombs, and he was the one who drove the car directly at those same officers. Four deaths in four days.

In just that short retelling, you already have evidence of age: 18 years or older; intentional killing of four victims, because every death was intended. There was no mistake or accident about any one of these. And you have and will have evidence of the following factors: the death of individuals during the commission of other crimes; the grave risk of death to people other than the victims; the heinous, cruel and depraved method of committing these crimes; substantial planning and premeditation; multiple killings and a vulnerable victim.

You have that information, but there will be more.

Keep asking the question: Why is the death penalty the appropriate and just sentence for Dzhokhar Tsarnaev? Because the evidence has shown and will show that Dzhokhar Tsarnaev

00:47 20

00:47 10

deliberately selected a glorious and famous international sporting event for its fame and for the vulnerability of its spectators; because he twisted the marathon into something cruel and ugly for his own purposes, and because he took the marathon and turned it into a political statement to bring attention to himself, to his own beliefs, and to others who would share those beliefs.

But the horror and the death of the victims, that told you what Dzhokhar Tsarnaev did and how he did it, but that horror is now joined with the impact of the never-ending loss upon the families of the victims. Only when all of those facts come together will you know the full effect of Dzhokhar Tsarnaev's acts upon the families left behind, and only then can you carefully weigh the factor of victim impact.

Your sentencing decision will be a consideration of Dzhokhar Tsarnaev's character and his actions, and it is not an exercise in comparison. Each and every time you hear Tamerlan Tsarnaev's name or any other person's name, you can ask yourselves why. Why are you hearing that? Tamerlan Tsarnaev, he's an easy target. Easy target while he lived, certainly an easy target when he's dead. He's not a substitute for his brother.

But it's much more than that. Because ask yourselves if there's anything about Tamerlan Tsarnaev or any other person that will explain to you how Dzhokhar Tsarnaev could take a

bomb, leave it behind a row of children, walk away, down the street, and detonate it. Is there anything that will explain how he could walk away from that happy and crowded scene, look back over his shoulder, knowing that he just left death there to go off, and he kept on going?

You may hear about family dynamics, family history, family dysfunction. But many people -- millions of people, one would venture -- face troubles throughout their lives. Who among them murders a child with a bomb?

You may see photos of Dzhokhar Tsarnaev at family gatherings, school events, dances, at camp, playing the drums. That might tell you he had the advantages of a good education at schools; that he led others, like those on his wrestling team; that he was taken care of, and that he was educated.

But nothing will explain his cruelty and his indifference. Nothing will, other than his own character. And everything you know and will know about Dzhokhar Tsarnaev and the crimes that he committed will reinforce he simply is callous and indifferent to human life. These personal characteristics are what set him apart, and it's his character that makes the death penalty appropriate and just.

It's not that hate and callous indifference to human life are anything new. Sadly, they're not. But neither are the notions of jihad or radicalization. Those didn't start with Dzhokhar Tsarnaev, and they certainly didn't start with

00:48 10

00:49 20

00:51 20

00:50 10

Tamerlan Tsarnaev, and it is tempting to look elsewhere when one's beliefs and actions are so fundamentally different than what you would expect from another human being.

So when Shakespeare wrote that "The fault, dear Brutus, is not in our stars but in ourselves," he was reminding us that we have to look inward. We have to look towards the person in whom the fault lies. No alignment of the heavens will explain or excuse Dzhokhar Tsarnaev.

The evidence presented and to be presented will show a person whose cruel character can be found in the way that he murdered and in his own reactions to those murders, his own beliefs, and his own motivations. It's the lines that he was so willing to cross that make him fundamentally different. And it may have been hard to imagine that an individual would have such feelings and then act upon them in such a way, but you no longer have to imagine. You've seen it.

If you want to understand Dzhokhar Tsarnaev and what he did, you don't have to look to the heavens for an answer. You can look for the man who walked alone down Boylston Street, knowing that his brother had taken up his own place at another location. You can look for the man who stood alone behind the Richard family for almost four minutes. You can look for the man who then walked off alone, leaving behind a bomb that would kill Lingzi and Martin; who, without his brother, got back to the UMass Dartmouth campus and three days later came back.

00:53 20

00:52 10

Look for the man who alone got the gun that killed Sean Collier; who alone went into the bank and used the debit card of a terrified carjacking victim to get money; and who drove alone down Laurel Street trying to mow down Watertown police officers; who escaped alone; and who then, alone with his own thoughts, wrote in his own words -- wrote and carved his manifesto into the inside of that boat on Franklin Street, declaring his beliefs and righteousness of his own actions.

All of that evidence, and that which will follow, will tell you that Dzhokhar Tsarnaev was and is unrepentant, uncaring, and untouched by the havoc and the sorrow that he has created. Remember Dr. Levitt said a small number of people cross the line into radicalization. But in reality, Dzhokhar Tsarnaev was willing to cross every line for personal glory and for reward. Kill innocents with a bomb: Done. Kill a police officer: Done. Kill a child: Done. All of those lines were crossed. They were erased. All those boundaries were shattered. It was done by Dzhokhar Tsarnaev.

You've seen the milk-buying video. You've seen the gym video. You've seen the Shell gas station video where he shops for snacks less than two hours after Officer Collier had been executed. And you know he was in Officer Collier's car. And he shops while a terrified carjacking victim sits outside.

You've also seen the Bank of America video. And while it hasn't received the attention of the others, it may be just

00:54 10

00:55 20

as telling. Dun Meng has been carjacked. He's been forced to give up his car and his PIN number. You watch Dzhokhar

Tsarnaev as he enters that bank. He calmly examines the card in his hand. During the course of the next three minutes, he first punches in the number, and it's wrong. Does he panic?

Does he run outside and seek the assistance of his brother?

No. He calmly reenters that number. He gets into the account, and he steals money. And then, as if he had all the time in the world, he tries to get more money.

Dzhokhar Tsarnaev was as successful as only he and

Inspire magazine could have hoped. "Successful means," Inspire

magazine wrote, "are through explosive devices and sacrificing

souls." These -- these are the souls that he sacrificed.

You're considering Dzhokhar Tsarnaev's character. And you're free to ask, does it really matter who came first in the long line of radicalization? As I said, Dzhokhar Tsarnaev wasn't the first to radicalize. Neither was Tamerlan. And whether Dzhokhar Tsarnaev was radicalized by his brother, by Anwar al-Awlaki, by some Internet lecture, by a song, or by a terrorist-to-go magazine, the origin and the lineage of terrorism don't matter. What matters are his beliefs in terrorism, his actions of terror, and the consequences of his actions upon others.

He believed, because terrorism sang to him, and then he acted. He killed. Nothing was forced upon him. He simply

00:56 10

00:56 20

shared. He shared his belief in terrorism, and he shared it with his brother and others.

These people, they were the enemy to Dzhokhar

Tsarnaev. He knew they were innocents. He even called them

that. But it didn't stop him from murdering them. Two young

women and a young man that won't ever reach the age of 30. And

a little boy who will never reach the third grade. This will

be their story. The impact that each of these young people had

in their lives and the impact of their death far exceeds the

scant number of years of life that they were given.

You know, some milestones in life are easy to spot, easy to prepare yourself for: birthdays and anniversaries, graduations. And then there are the little things: teaching your child how to ride a bike, drive a car, taking him to dancing lessons or watching him go off to the prom, going to ball games with him or watching them play baseball, going to visit the grandparents or just hiking a trail.

But it's the very smallest of details woven together that make up a life, and that's where grief resides. It's every minute of every day, grief and loss, and it is inescapable. It's the laugh that no one will ever hear again. It's the talented fingers that won't ever touch the keyboard again. It's the selfies that won't be shared or laughed over. It's the phone calls and texts that won't be sent or received. It's even the little irritations of life. Who drives you crazy

when they leave their sports equipment in the hallway? Who doesn't put away the laundry? Who ate the last piece of cake?

Things that make you laugh and make you cry at the same time. And even in moments of happiness, sadness will remain. And the thoughts of the future will bring no peace. Every time someone thinks, Oh, he really would have enjoyed that game. Or, Look at that, she would have looked great in that dress. Or, Remember that grandpa was so proud of him? It will come with a wrenching ache.

All of this loss is senseless, and it will remain so because there's no sense to be made of it. And these deaths are inexplicable because there are no explanations. And these crimes are inexcusable because there should be no excuses.

The Boston-born poet and philosopher, Ralph Waldo
Emerson, wrote, "The only person you are destined to become is
the person you decide to be." Destiny: It's the sum of one's
decisions and actions and beliefs. It's as personal and
individual as a fingerprint. And for Dzhokhar Tsarnaev, his
decisions and his actions and his beliefs made up who he was
and who he is. His destiny was determined by him, and he was
determined and destined to be America's worst nightmare.

You can keep your hearts and minds open, and you'll find a man whose heart was full of rage and whose mind was dead set on the path that he took.

On July 10th, 2013, almost three months after Dzhokhar

00:57 10

00:58 20

```
1
         Tsarnaev had murdered Krystle Marie Campbell, Lingzi Lu, Martin
         Richard, and Officer Sean Collier, he was here in this
     2
         courthouse. He knew the United States had charged him for his
     3
         crimes. In the room that he was in, there was a video camera.
     5
         Dzhokhar Tsarnaev was alone. There was no brother with him.
         And once more, just as he had done with the boat on Franklin
     7
         Street, he had one more message to send.
     8
                   (Photograph displayed.)
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: This should be on the screens.
     9
00:59 10
                  This is Dzhokhar Tsarnaev, unconcerned, unrepentant,
    11
         and unchanged. Without remorse, he remains untouched by the
         grief and the loss that he caused. And without assistance, he
    12
    13
         remains the unrepentant killer that he is. It is because of
    14
         who Dzhokhar Tsarnaev is that the United States will return and
    15
         ask you to find that the just and appropriate sentence for
         Dzhokhar Tsarnaev is death.
    16
    17
                  Thank you.
    18
                  THE COURT: All right, Mr. Mellin.
    19
                  MR. MELLIN: Thank you, your Honor.
01:03 20
                  Your Honor, the United States calls Celeste
    21
         Corcoran.
    22
                           CELESTE CORCORAN, duly sworn
    23
                  THE CLERK: Have a seat. State your name and spell
    24
         your last name for the record, if you would, please.
    25
                  THE WITNESS: My name is Celeste Corcoran,
```

- 1 C-E-L-E-S-T-E, C-O-R-C-O-R-A-N.
- 2 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 3 BY MR. MELLIN:
- 4 Q. Good morning, Ms. Corcoran. I think it's still morning.
- 5 Can you pull the microphone maybe just a little bit closer to
- 6 you?
- 7 A. (Witness complies.)
- 8 Q. Thank you.
- 9 A. Better?
- 01:04 10 Q. That's much better. Thanks a lot.
  - 11 Miss Corcoran, where did you grow up?
  - 12 A. I grew up in Lowell, Massachusetts.
  - 13 Q. At some point did you graduate from high school?
  - 14 A. Yes, I did.
  - 15 Q. And where was that?
  - 16 A. It was a vocational high school.
  - 17 Q. Okay. Did you meet Kevin Corcoran at some point?
  - 18 A. Yes, I did.
  - 19 Q. And who is Kevin Corcoran?
- 01:05 20 A. Kevin is my husband.
  - 21 Q. When did you meet?
  - 22 A. We met as teenagers through a family friend.
  - 23 Q. At some point did you get married?
  - 24 A. Yes, we did. In 1989.
  - 25 Q. And when was that --

```
1
         Α.
              I'm sorry?
     2
              -- if you remember.
         Q.
     3
              Do you remember when you got married?
     4
         Α.
              Yes.
     5
                   (Laughter.)
     6
         Α.
               1989.
     7
              Do you have any children?
         Q.
     8
              I do.
         Α.
              How many children?
01:05 10
         Α.
              Two.
    11
             Who are they?
         Q.
              Tyler; he's 22. And Sydney will have her birthday in just
    12
    13
         a couple of days, and she's going to be 20.
    14
         Q.
              And Sydney previously testified in this courtroom.
                                                                    Is
    15
         that right?
             Yes, she did.
    16
         Α.
              After you graduated from high school, did you begin work?
    17
         Q.
              I did. I started working as a hairstylist immediately.
    18
         Α.
    19
         Q.
              And did you continue to work as a hairstylist up until the
         time of April of 2013?
01:06 20
    21
              I did.
         Α.
    22
         Q.
              And around that time, where were you working?
    23
              I'm sorry?
         Α.
              Where were you working?
    24
         Q.
```

I was working at Emerge Spa & Salon on Newbury Street.

25

Α.

- 1 Q. Do you know where Newbury Street is in relation to
- 2 Boylston Street?
- 3 A. It's parallel to it.
- 4 Q. Okay. It's just one block over running parallel?
- 5 A. Yes. Yes.
- 6 Q. Okay. And how long had you worked on Newbury Street?
- 7 A. I believe it's been about 15 years, 14 years.
- 8 Q. On April the 15th of 2013, did you go to the Boston
- 9 Marathon?
- 01:06 10 A. I did.
  - 11 Q. Why did you attend?
  - 12 A. I went because my sister, Carmen, my only sister, was
  - 13 running the marathon.
  - 14 Q. Had you ever run a marathon?
  - 15 A. God, no.
  - 16 (Laughter.)
  - 17 A. No. And this was her first marathon. It was supposed to
  - 18 be a one-and-done. And I watched her train so hard, and there
  - 19 was no way that my entire family was going to miss her running
- 01:07 20 | that marathon. I had never been to the Boston Marathon myself.
  - 21 Q. So on the morning of April 15, what did you do?
  - 22 A. We left Lowell very early. One of my friends lives close
  - 23 by, and she has a parking spot for us to stay -- to park in.
  - 24 And I was very worried about parking and road closings and
  - 25 | everything, so we went early. We left Lowell probably about

8:30 in the morning, and so got to Boston fairly early.

And I just remember that it was such a beautiful day. And we had so much time, so we went on Commonwealth Ave, in that little grassy area, I think it's called the mall, and we had some Dunkin' Donuts, we talked. It was my husband, my daughter and I.

- 7 And when you say your daughter, Sydney? Q.
- Yes. 8 Α.

1

2

3

5

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

25

01:08 20

- Q. Okay.
- 01:08 10 And then when I work, I usually, you know, go to work and Α. 11 then go home, and I don't explore the city that much. So we decided that we had enough time, I had said that I had never 12 13 walked over the Arthur Fiedler Footbridge, so we decided to 14 take a little stroll. And we walked over that and we went over to the Hatch Shell. I had never been in that area before. And 15 we walked out onto -- closer to the water, onto this little

pier, you know, where there were these chairs there.

And I just remember it being so beautiful. We were sitting in the sun. And I remember sitting sideways in my chair, and I just kind of put my feet up on the back of the -- on the side of the chair and just kind of, you know, raising my face to the sun and just thinking that it was such a beautiful day.

When you talk about the water, that's the Charles River right there?

A. Yes.

- 2 Q. After that, where did you go?
- 3 A. We made our way back to Newbury Street. We met up with
- 4 friends of ours, Ron and Karen Brassard, and their daughter
- 5 Krystara. We were tracking my sister through our cell phones
- 6 and stuff, so we knew that we still had some time. So the
- 7 girls split off and we went into a couple of little shops, and
- 8 the guys went to Joe's for a beer, and we agreed to meet maybe,
- 9 like, an hour later. We knew -- because we knew that it was
- 01:09 10 close to the time that my sister -- we wanted to be at the
  - 11 finish line maybe -- you know, the tracking device wasn't
  - 12 extremely accurate, so we wanted to be there in plenty of time
  - 13 to absolutely not miss her.
  - 14 | So actually, then we -- when we did meet up, we ate at
  - 15 | Stephanie's restaurant on Newbury Street.
  - 16 Q. And do you know what cross-street that's at? Is that at
  - 17 Exeter?
  - 18 A. What?
  - 19 Q. Do you know what cross-street that is at?
- 01:10 20 A. I believe it's --
  - 21 Q. Is it Exeter?
  - 22 A. Exeter. I think it's Exeter.
  - 23 Q. All right.
  - 24 A. So when we were done eating lunch, we decided that it was
  - 25 | time to make our way up onto Boylston Street. And we went up

- 1 Exeter and --
- 2 Q. At that time who was all together as a group?
- 3 A. So it was myself, my husband Kevin, Sydney, Ron and Karen
- 4 Brassard, their daughter Krystara, and Krystara had called her
- 5 roommate Victoria, I believe her last name was McGrath.
- 6 Q. All right.
- 7 A. And we all made our way to Boylston Street. And at that
- 8 point my husband pointed out that we were -- we were going to
- 9 stay right there, and he was like, "Okay. We're behind the
- 01:11 10 finish line. You're not going to see her finish." So he made
  - 11 the call that we should all move towards the finish line. So
  - 12 | we followed him and got to -- a couple of times along the way
  - we tried to get him to stop because we thought we were close
  - 14 | enough, but we ended up in front of Marathon Sports, and that's
  - 15 where we stopped to watch.
  - 16 Q. Okay.
  - MR. MELLIN: Your Honor, if I could have, just for the
  - 18 | witness right now, Exhibit 1594.
  - 19 Q. Mrs. Corcoran, do you see the exhibit in front of you now
- 01:12 20 on the screen?
  - 21 A. Yes.
  - 22 Q. And is that a photograph of where you were standing along
  - 23 Boylston Street at the marathon?
  - 24 A. Yes, it is.
  - 25 Q. And as you look at it, in fact, do you see yourself in the

- 1 photograph? I'm right here (indicating). Will that show? 2 It's actually -- if you could just answer "yes" or "no" Q. for right now. 5 Α. Oh, I'm sorry. Q. Do you see yourself in that photograph? 7 A. Yes, I do. And Sydney, and your husband Kevin as well? Q. A. Yes, I do. 01:12 10 Q. Okay. And is that a fair and accurate picture of where 11 you were standing at that time? A. Yes, it is. 12 13 MR. MELLIN: Your Honor, I would move into evidence 14 Exhibit 1594. 15 MS. CLARKE: Subject to the previously noted 16 objection. 17 THE COURT: All right. It's admitted over the 18 objection. 19 MR. MELLIN: And if it may be published, please? 01:13 20 Thank you. 21 (Government Exhibit No. 1594 received into evidence.)
  - (Government Exhibit No. 1594 received into evidence.)
  - 22 BY MR. MELLIN:
  - Q. Now, Mrs. Corcoran, you were about to touch the screen.
  - 24 | Can you please circle yourself in this photograph?
  - 25 A. (Witness complies.)

- Q. Thank you. And you drew a circle around the person who is actually identified as Celeste Corcoran, right?
- 3 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And there's also a line drawn to Sydney and a line drawn to your husband Kevin as well. Is that right?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. All right.
- MR. MELLIN: We could take that down, Mr. Bruemmer.
- 9 Thank you.
- 01:13 10 Q. Mrs. Corcoran, shortly after you got to that location there by the flags, what happened?
  - 12 A. We -- I remember being a little frustrated because we were
  - maybe six or seven people deep from the fence and my -- I was
  - determined that I was going to see my sister -- I needed to see
  - my sister cross the finish line. So Sydney at the time was
  - 16 taller than me, and I was kind of using her shoulder to kind of
  - 17 lift myself up. And I just remember my head being on a swivel,
  - 18 looking back and forth, you know. And we would yell back and
  - 19 forth to each other, like, "Did you see it? Did you see
- 01:14 20 anything?" And we were just waiting and waiting.
  - 21 And then Ron and Karen sort of -- I didn't know because I
  - 22 was so attuned to watching the street, but Ron and Karen had
  - 23 | sort of -- we had sort of spread out a little bit, but Sydney
  - 24 did stay next to me. And at that point I think my husband
  - 25 | had -- was joking around with Ron and Karen and -- about the

- signs. Karen had made some signs to cheer my sister on. then our whole world just exploded.
  - What do you remember about the explosion?

2

3

4

5

8

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

25

01:17 20

I, unfortunately, remember every single detail. I did not pass out. I remember being thrown up in the air, or having the sensation of kind of flipping around. I remember just, like, 7 landing hard, not being able to breathe. I remember this thick, thick, black, heavy smoke. I was choking. I was trying to spit stuff out of my mouth. I was completely confused. I 01:16 10 didn't know what had happened.

> There was this -- it's so hard to describe. It was like this deafening silence. And when I opened my eyes and, you know, could see the black smoke and everything, I could hear -my eardrums got blown out. So I just remember that being so irritating, like, why can't I hear? It was like my mind hadn't caught up yet with what had happened.

> And I remember hearing just blood-curdling screams. remember just looking around, not really seeing -- just seeing blood everywhere, sort of, like, debris falling from the sky. It was such a surreal kind of out-of-body experience. very hard to explain but I want to try and get it right for you all to understand. And I just remember lying there, and I think as my brain was kind of catching up, I just remember thinking, like, what was that, you know? And...

Q. As you lay there, did you look around and could you see

1 what was around you? You mentioned blood but --I saw blood. I saw a lot of blood. And when I had 2 flipped, I remember feeling someone. I pushed off of someone 3 or something. Our bodies collided or something. And I don't 4 5 know who that was. And I remember trying to sit up, and I couldn't sit up. 7 And I remember looking down, and I just saw -- as much as I could sit up and look down, I just remember seeing so much 8 blood where my legs were and my -- one of my feet at a weird 01:18 10 angle. And I just remember inside my head as it started to 11 kind of process, like the pain started -- I started to feel the pain. And I just remember thinking, No, no. I want it to be 12 13 five minutes ago. Like what just happened? This can't be 14 happening. This can't be reality. And nothing went away, you know? Everything stayed the same, and the pain increased. 15 Q. At that time, did you know where Sydney was? 16 I did not. I did not. Right away my husband came down. 17 18 I saw him. He was right in my face, and he was touching my 19 hair and he was telling me it was going to be okay. He 01:19 20 literally said the words to me, "This was a terrorist bomb" or 21 attack. I don't remember exactly which word he used, but he said "terrorist." He said, "This is a terrorist attack" or 22 23 bomb. And I remember thinking, I don't care. Like just 24 what -- I just remember thinking how awful this was and how 25 this had to stop. This couldn't be real. Couldn't be real.

01:21 20

01:20 10

And then he started to apply pressure on my legs. And I was just in such excruciating pain and there was so much screaming and chaos that it was like I just had to kind of -- to kind of keep it together I just had to kind of go into myself, and I just raised my arms to cover my eyes because I didn't want to look at anything else.

Q. At that time what were you thinking was going to happen to you?

A. I didn't know. I just remember how much I hurt. And I think it was at that point that I asked my husband -- I said, "Kevin, are my feet attached to my legs?" and he said yes. And they were. And then I don't know how much longer after that, because he kept applying pressure and I was just in so much pain, but in my head -- because he was okay and he was tending to me, I thought that Sydney was okay. Like I knew that other people obviously were hurt because of all the screaming and the blood and everything that I saw, but I thought that she was okay.

And I said to him, "How's Sydney?" thinking that she would be devastated to see me because I knew how hurt -- or I suspected how hurt I was. And he didn't know. Sydney got blown back from us but he thought -- he said, "I think she's okay. I think she's with Ron and Karen." So that, thankfully, let me kind of calm down and try and just keep it together until -- all I could think of was -- I just kept going over and

2

5

7

01:22 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

25

01:23 20

```
over in my head, No, no, no. This doesn't happen here.
doesn't -- this couldn't have happened. I'm dreaming.
                                                       I'm
going to wake up, something.
    At some point did someone apply tourniquets to your legs?
Q.
Α.
    My husband did.
Q.
    To both legs?
    He did. He took his belt off and applied one to one of my
legs, and then he stopped someone walking past us and he got
his belt and he applied the other tourniquet. And then he just
kept putting this excruciating pressure on my legs. And he
kind of crouched down beside me, and he was trying to keep me
calm because he knew that I was on the verge of freaking out.
    And he just kept -- I'll never forget. He just kept
touching my head and taking my hair away from my face, and he
just kept telling me that he loved me and that I was going to
live and he wasn't going to leave my side and that it was going
to be okay. "Hold on. Hold on. It's going to be okay." And
he said, "I'm not going to leave."
Q.
    At some point were you moved from that scene?
          They -- I'm assuming the ambulance people came to
        They put me on a board or gurney. I have no idea
what. I just know that when they moved me, I think that was
the first time that I had breath enough to scream in agony,
them moving me, because it hurt my legs so bad. And then I
```

remember them taking me into the medical tent.

And inside the medical tent there was like this like 1 controlled chaos. Like you could tell that everybody was sort 2 of frantic but trying to hold it together. People were 3 yelling. They were cutting my clothes off me. I remember them 4 5 cutting through my top and I remember them writing on my chest a number. They said -- I said, "What are you doing?" And they 7 said, "We're writing a number on you." I believe they said they were writing the number one. I can't be positive about 8 that but -- she said she was writing a number on my chest 01:24 10 because they had to get me out fast. And I just remember them 11 saying, "She needs to leave. She needs to leave now. Get her out of here." 12 13 At that point what are you feeling? 14 Excruciating pain. Inside there, I don't remember any of their faces because, again, I had -- I guess that was my 15 defense, I had my arms up and I was just trying to just 16 breathe. I had never felt pain like that before in my life and 17 18 I just was trying to hold it together. And all I could think 19 was, Okay. They're going to get me to the hospital, they're 01:25 20 going to fix my legs. They're going to knock me out, I'm going to go into surgery, they're going to fix my legs. It's going 21 22 to be okay. I just have to hang on until they get me to the 23 hospital. They just have to get me to the hospital. 24 Q. Did you look down to the see the extent of the injuries at that time? 25

1 Α. I did not. 2 Q. Why not? I think because I was just in too much pain. I didn't 3 It just hurt too much. It wasn't relevant at that 4 5 point. It was just I was in too much pain to move. Any movement was just horrific. I remember thinking that I was going to die, that I couldn't -- no one can go through that 7 much pain. And I didn't know how bad it was. I knew it was 8 very bad and I was just thinking, Is this it? Is this -- am I 01:26 10 going to die? 11 And I remember thinking that I wanted to die. I remember 12 thinking that the pain was too much and I just wanted to die. 13 And then on the heels of that, I remember almost 14 instantaneously it was like -- I don't know if it was the mom 15 in me or, you know, just -- I don't know where it came from but I just remember thinking, I just want to die, just let me die, 16 and then immediately I was like, Hell no. I don't want to die. 17 18 Please don't let me die, you know? 19 Then that was the mantra, sort of, that I was saying. And 01:26 20 it was like, I can't die. I have to be there for my kids. have to be there for my husband. I have too much living to do. 21 22 Don't let this be the end. How can this be the end? 23 Do you remember what hospital you were taken to?

I don't remember them telling me that, I don't think, but

I know I went to Boston Medical Center.

24

the attendant was trying to go between the two of us.

01:28 20

01:28 10

Q. And when you got to Boston Medical Center, what happened?

A. So they wheeled me in. So I do know that when we left the tent, I know that Kevin was with me, and I know that they told him to ride in the front of the ambulance. And there was a woman in the ambulance with me, I don't know who that was, but

And when we got to the hospital and they wheeled me in, again, it was that controlled chaos, like everybody moving so fast that you -- like I, again, shut my eyes. Like they're like running you down the hallway and people are yelling instructions at each other and you just know -- you can hear in their voice how serious this is so it scares the hell out of you. But at the same time they're trying to comfort you, you know.

And they were cutting my clothes off, and one nurse was at my head and she was asking me what my name was. And at that point I remember feeling -- I was so cold, and I remember -- I remember my hands, they felt like they were like cramping up. Like I remember trying to, like -- I don't know what I was trying to do, if I was trying to move my hair or something, but I remember my fingers feeling like they were cramping up and I remember thinking I was like -- my face felt like it had all pins and needles so it was hard for me to talk. And her asking me the questions.

I remember just thinking, like, Just knock me out. Just

do something. What are you doing? And she was asking me if I was allergic to medications, and then she asked me if I was there with anybody, and I said my husband. And she said, "No, he's not here with you." And I said, "Yes, he is." And I said, "He came with me in the ambulance." And she said, "We can't find him."

And I remember at that point, I think because I was in so much pain, my patience had just run out, and I remember I definitely snapped at her and I said, "He was in the ambulance with me. Go find him." And then I remember a doctor on the other side of me standing there...

(Pause.)

01:30 20

01:29 10

A. ...just kind of stoically standing there without a lot of emotion. And he had a clipboard in his hand. And in my mind at that point they were going to fix me. I didn't know what was happening down there but they were going to fix me. And he had this clipboard, and he looked at me and he said, just, you know, so matter-of-factly, he said, "Celeste, Celeste, we need you to sign this because we need to amputate both your legs."

And I just remember looking at him and I went, "Both?" And he said, "Yes."

And all I could think of at that time was that, you know, they wouldn't be telling me that if that didn't have to happen.

I just needed the pain to stop. So I just scribbled my name, and they must have knocked me out after that.

- Q. Do you know where Sydney was at that point in time when you were going into surgery?
- 3 A. No, I did not.
  - Q. At some point later did you learn that she was there at
- 5 Boston Medical Center at the same time?
- 6 A. Yes. It was after I woke up. I woke up and they told me
- 7 that she had been hurt, she had had surgery, and they were
- 8 going to put us in the same room together. And that's what
- 9 they did. They brought us in the same room together. At that
- 01:31 10 point I didn't know the extent of her injuries at all, I just
  - 11 knew that my daughter was there. And I was just so glad -- I
  - 12 mean, that my husband was there and my daughter was alive.
  - 13 We just -- I just couldn't stop crying because it was the
  - 14 second time I almost lost her, and I was so glad that she was
  - 15 alive, that she wasn't taken from me.
  - 16 Q. How long were you and Sydney in the same hospital room?
  - 17 A. They put us in the same room for our entire stay. I think
  - 18 | we were in the hospital -- my time gets blurred. I think we
  - 19 were there maybe three or four weeks.
- 01:32 20 | Q. And during that time, did you either hear or observe
  - 21 problems she was having or complications she was having?
  - 22 A. Yes. Yes.
  - 23 0. What were those?
  - 24 A. So that was probably the most heartbreaking or
  - 25 | heart-wrenching thing as a mom. I am such a mom. I mother

1 everybody. And to see your child in pain and not be able to 2 get up and go to them. So our hospital beds were, you know, on either side of the room, and Sydney had a reaction to I think a 3 pain medication that she had. So she was violently ill. And I 5 just remember just helplessly laying there in my bed watching my daughter be violently ill. And I couldn't get up, I 7 couldn't go to her, I couldn't hear because my eardrums got 8 blown out. So when everyone was hovered around her and talking and saying what they were going to do to her or what was going 01:33 10 on, I didn't know what was happening. And that was probably 11 one of the hardest things as well as, you know, just being with 12 her through her recovery, that I've had to go through with her, 13 is seeing her in pain and not being able to go to her and 14 comfort her. 15

- After you were at Boston Medical Center, were you moved to
- Spaulding Rehab? 16
- Yes, we were. 17 Α.
- 18 The two of you were moved?
- 19 We were moved together. We were in adjoining rooms. Α.
- 01:34 20 believe I stayed for -- it might have been just under two
  - 21 weeks -- and Sydney stayed less than that. I'm not sure if it
  - 22 was four or five, six days.
  - 23 What were the full extent of the injuries you sustained? 0.
  - 24 Α. I'm sorry?
  - 25 Q. What was the extent of the injuries you sustained? You

1 mentioned your eardrums were blown out at the scene. 2 Α. Yes. What else? Q. My eardrums were blown out, I had shrapnel that hit my 4 5 body. My legs -- as a result of the shrapnel that hit my body, I am now a double amputee, one below the knee and one above the 7 knee. And I wear prosthetic limbs. And along my right side -the blast came from my right side, so along my right side, along my right thigh I have -- and on my face just a little 01:35 10 bit, it's almost like -- the doctors told me it's almost like a 11 tattoo. It's like debris, maybe dirt, something that is probably -- it's not big pieces of shrapnel but it's something 12 13 that will probably be forever embedded in my skin as a constant 14 reminder, as if my legs weren't enough. 15 How many surgeries did you undergo? So I had three surgeries, I believe, within that first 16 17

A. So I had three surgeries, I believe, within that first week on my legs, and then they were able to -- they do the surgeries to remove all the shrapnel and know that they can close it and it's going to be okay, so it required three surgeries, and then they were at a point where they could close it up. And those were the only surgeries on my legs.

18

19

21

22

23

24

25

01:36 20

But then after those surgeries, when I started to lessen -- when I started to need less medication, I realized that a piece of shrapnel had hit my cheek. It didn't penetrate but it had broken my tooth, and a nerve -- my back molar, a

nerve was completely exposed. And I can't believe I'm saying this, but, you know, having your legs amputated, when you have a raw nerve that's just exposed, that was pretty painful also. And I couldn't eat. And I was complaining about that.

And they said that they couldn't fix it in the hospital because it wasn't, like, oral surgery. I needed to see a regular dentist. But I was in so much agony with that that -- I believe he was a dental resident or something came to see me, and he just did a quick fix. Like he saw what was going on and he put some kind of compound -- he had to jam it in there. And that wasn't fun.

- 12 Q. Was that ultimately fixed at some point?
- 13 A. Yes, after I was -- I believe it was after I came home 14 from Spaulding.
- 15 Q. What happened with your eardrums?

again for a good couple of months.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

11

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

25

01:38 20

01:37 10

A. So my left ear ended up healing itself. After three months they checked me, and the left ear had healed itself, but my right ear, there wasn't enough of the eardrum to grow back. So I made the decision to get surgery on my ear to rebuild the eardrum. So I had that done. And that was a lot more difficult than I thought it was going to be. I thought, you know, It's my ear. How bad can it be? I lost my legs. But that surgery was really tough and it kind of knocked me down

So the surgery was a success in that I now have a

```
1
         functioning eardrum and I don't have a hole there any longer,
         but my hearing -- they were hoping that my hearing would at
     2
         least come back to what the other side was, and it did not. So
         I have significant enough hearing loss in that ear to wear a
     5
         hearing aid.
              As you sit here today, just for the record, you're wearing
     7
         two prosthetic legs, correct?
              I am.
     8
         Α.
              One is above the knee and one below the knee?
01:39 10
         Α.
              Yup.
    11
              Are there circulation problems that accompany having
    12
         double amputations?
    13
              I don't know what you mean about circulation problems.
         Α.
    14
         just know that I never forget that I'm a double amputee. I
         always have -- I wouldn't really call it pain, but it's always
    15
         a level of discomfort. Right now when I'm wearing my
    16
         prosthetics I kind of feel -- it's weird, but I feel like I
    17
    18
         have legs and feet. Like I feel like I'm curling my toes right
    19
         now, which is a little comforting to me, but right now I'm not
         comfortable.
01:40 20
    21
              The bottoms of my limbs are constantly -- there's this
    22
         constant -- it's like a numb, burning sensation. And a lot of
    23
         times -- and that's with the prosthetics on. And with the
    24
         prosthetics off, it comes and goes. Sometimes it feels like --
    25
         the only way I can describe it is if -- you feel like you've
```

```
had the worst athlete's foot in your life. It's like this
     1
         horrible burning. There's times when I get shooting pains, and
     2
         it literally makes me catch my breath. Like people notice when
     3
         that happens to me. When I get those shooting pains, it's
     5
         strange because I feel it in my feet. It's always my feet. It
         feels like somebody stabbed a toe or stabbed my heel or my calf
         or something. But it's usually my feet.
     7
              So can I get on with my life? Absolutely.
     8
              Let me ask you: Did you at some point after the bombings
         Q.
01:41 10
         get a service dog?
    11
              I'm sorry?
         Α.
    12
              Did you get a service dog?
    13
              I did get a service dog.
         Α.
    14
         Q.
              What is the name of your service dog?
              Sebastian.
    15
         Α.
             Sebastian's not in the courtroom today, correct?
    16
         Q.
              No, he's in the other room waiting for me.
    17
         Α.
    18
              All right. And exactly what assistance does Sebastian
         Q.
    19
         provide you?
01:41 20
              So he helps with my mobility. I -- as a double amputee, I
         have problems just walking. You know, on a flat surface it's
    21
    22
         easier, but walking -- I'm still not comfortable. I still
         haven't ventured out by myself walking on the sidewalk or -- an
    23
    24
         uneven surface, you don't realize until you're a double amputee
```

how many dips and hills or whatever there are, inclines there

are.

- Inclines are the worse [sic]. Going up is fine, but the inclines are very hard, and he helps me navigate those. He has a harness, and I hold on to the harness and he braces me. And
- 5 if I've fallen, he's trained to -- I get up by myself but
- 6 then -- well, partly get up, and then I can put my -- I can
- 7 tell him to brace, and I can put my hand on his shoulder and he
- 8 braces for me, to put a little bit more of my weight to get up.
  - Q. If I could have you look at a few photographs, please.
- 01:43 10 Exhibit 9 which is already in evidence.
  - 11 A. I should have brought my glasses.
  - 12 Q. I believe Ms. Conrad has some that you can use.
  - 13 A. May I? Thank you.
  - 14 Q. As you look at Exhibit 9, who do you recognize in that
  - 15 photograph?
  - 16 A. I see my husband.
  - 17 Q. And if you could, please, just draw a circle around
  - 18 Mr. Corcoran.
  - 19 A. (Witness complies.)
- 01:43 20 Q. And you drew a circle around the man in a red coat in the
  - 21 middle of the photograph. Is that right?
  - 22 A. Yes.
  - 23 Q. At that time he's over the top of you?
  - 24 A. Yes.
  - 25 Q. Okay. Do you see your daughter Sydney?

```
I do.
     1
         Α.
     2
               Would you please circle her?
               (Witness complies.)
     3
         Α.
               And for the record, you drew a circle around the woman
     4
         Q.
     5
         who's down on the ground by the black fencing?
         Α.
               Yes.
     7
               Thank you.
         Q.
     8
                   MR. MELLIN: If I could have Exhibit 13, please.
     9
                   THE COURT: Also in evidence?
01:44 10
                   MR. MELLIN: Yes, your Honor.
    11
         BY MR. MELLIN:
               And for the record, who is shown in Exhibit 13?
    12
    13
              That's my daughter.
         Α.
    14
         Q.
               If I could have you look at Exhibit 12, please.
    15
                   MR. MELLIN: Also in evidence, your Honor.
              Mrs. Corcoran, as you look at Exhibit 12, do you see
    16
    17
         yourself?
               I do.
    18
         Α.
    19
         Q.
               Could you please circle yourself?
01:44 20
         Α.
               (Witness complies.)
    21
               For the record, you're the woman with the gray top on
    22
         that's being assisted by the man in the red coat?
    23
         Α.
               Yes.
```

And again, that's your husband, Kevin Corcoran?

24

25

Q.

Α.

Yes, it is.

- 1 Q. All right. Do you know Mary Daniel?
- 2 A. Mary? Yes.
- 3 Q. And how do you know Mary?
- 4 A. Through Spaulding Rehab.
- 5 Q. And do you know if she had a leg that was amputated?
- 6 A. She did.
- 7 Q. Do you see her in this photograph?
- 8 A. I do.
- 9 Q. Could you circle her, please?
- 01:45 10 A. (Witness complies.)
  - 11 Q. And for the record, you circled the woman who's
  - 12 essentially in the middle of the photograph, I think wearing
  - white. It's really hard to tell in that photo. Is that right?
  - 14 A. Yes.
  - 15 Q. Okay. And do you see the individual just below Ms. Daniel
  - 16 in that photograph?
  - 17 A. I see Jeff Bauman.
  - 18 Q. Okay. Thank you.
  - 19 A. With his legs sticking out. His raw legs sticking out.
- 01:45 20 Q. And finally, if I could have you look at Exhibit 20 --
  - MR. MELLIN: Which is in evidence, your Honor.
  - 22 Q. Mrs. Corcoran, as you look at Exhibit 20, do you see
  - 23 yourself in that photograph?
  - 24 A. Yes, I do.
  - 25 Q. And could you circle where you are in Exhibit 20?

- 1 A. (Witness complies.)
- 2 Q. For the record, you've circled the woman at the top right
- 3 corner of the photograph?
- A. Yes.
- 5 Q. And do you see someone with their hand on your leg wearing
- 6 a red coat?
- 7 A. Right here?
- 8 Q. Yes.
- 9 A. Yup.
- 01:46 10 Q. What is going on there?
  - 11 A. I believe my husband is applying pressure to my legs.
  - 12 Q. Thank you.
  - MR. MELLIN: Thank you, your Honor.
  - If I may just have one moment.
  - 15 (Counsel confer off the record.)
  - 16 BY MR. MELLIN:
  - 17 Q. May I have you look at Exhibit 1449, which I'm not sure is
  - 18 in evidence.
  - MR. MELLIN: Just for the witness, please.
- 01:47 20 Q. Do you recognize Exhibit 1449?
  - 21 A. That's my daughter Sydney. That's her legs.
  - 22 Q. Is that a fair and accurate photograph of the scars on her
  - 23 legs?
  - 24 A. It's not all of them, but, yes, it is.
  - MR. MELLIN: Your Honor, we would move into evidence

```
1
         Exhibit 1449 and ask to publish.
                  MS. CLARKE: Subject to the earlier objection.
     2
                  THE COURT: All right. Overruled and admitted.
     3
                   (Government Exhibit No. 1449 received into evidence.)
     4
     5
         BY MR. MELLIN:
              Mrs. Corcoran, as we look at Exhibit 1449, you said that's
     7
         some of the scars but not all of them. Can you describe the
         scar that's on the left inner thigh of your daughter Sydney?
              The scar on the left is where they took a vein or artery
01:48 10
         from her leg to put it on the right-hand side where her femoral
    11
         artery was severed, to reattach her femoral artery.
    12
              Okay. And the reattachment, was that the scarring that we
    13
         see at the top of her thigh on 1449?
    14
         Α.
              Which side? It's -- I'm sorry.
    15
              Can you describe the two scars that you see on the right
         leg of your daughter?
    16
              Okay. So on my daughter's right leg -- can I circle?
    17
         Α.
    18
         Q.
              Yes.
    19
              So on my daughter's right leg, right here is where a piece
01:48 20
         of the pressure cooker went into her leg.
              And just for the record, as you look at 1449, that's the
    21
    22
         scar on the farthest left of the photograph?
              It went into her femoral artery. And you don't see, but
    23
```

up here, the piece of the bomb, it was the size of a cell

phone, and it was in her leg here and sticking out here. So it

24

- 1 severed her femoral artery, so they took a vein from here and
- 2 attached it here where she was damaged, where she almost bled
- 3 out from (indicating).
- 4 Q. All right. So you started with the scar on the farthest
- 5 left on this photograph, is that right, as you're looking at
- 6 it?
- 7 A. The scar on her left is --
- 8 Q. No, no, no. In the photo. I'm totally confusing you.
- 9 A. I'm sorry.
- 01:49 10 Q. As you look at this photograph, the scar on the left is
  - 11 the entry wound of a piece of the pressure cooker?
  - 12 A. Yes, it is.
  - 13 Q. And then you indicated that it went through and was
  - 14 embedded in the --
  - 15 A. Right here. Up.
  - 16 Q. -- area between her thighs?
  - 17 | A. Yes.
  - 18 Q. Is that fair to say?
  - 19 A. Yes. She was very close to losing her leg.
- 01:49 20 Q. And so then the surgeons took an artery out of her left
  - 21 leg and put it in the right leg, and that's attached to the
  - 22 scar that is kind of running down the middle of her thigh?
  - 23 A. Yes. And both those scars -- may I say this? Both those
  - 24 scars go all the way up here (indicating).
  - 25 Q. And for the record now, you just indicated that the scars

- go from what is shown in 1449, they go up to almost her -- the base of her abdomen?
- 3 A. Yup.

01:50 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

25

01:51 20

- Q. You also mentioned there is other scarring as well. What other scarring did she have or does she have?
- A. She had a hole blown through her foot, she had -- so she has no feeling. Do you want me to elaborate on that?
- 8 Q. A little bit, yes. Go ahead.
  - A. She had a hole blown through her foot. So her -- if this is her foot, the hole was blown through right here, and she's missing this bone in her foot so her pinky toe is like -- it has no feeling whatsoever; it's just attached by tendons.

She has numerous other shrapnel wounds, but what you don't see on her legs in those pictures, because they're of her thighs, is on her right leg, where the graft was done, she has on her calf -- I'm sorry -- on her calf she has two incisions that go the entire length of her calf that basically look like two zippers. And I'm not a doctor, but I believe it was called compartmental syndrome, because when they reattached the veins and arteries, there's a danger of, like, too much blood flow going down there, so they need to make those incisions so that basically her leg would just kind of blow up. So she has those scars also. I'm trying to think. Just other, you know, scarring on her whole leg from different pieces of shrapnel.

Q. Thank you.

```
1
                  MR. MELLIN: Thank you, your Honor.
                  MS. CLARKE: Thank you very much. No questions.
     2
                  THE COURT: No questions?
     3
                  All right, Ms. Corcoran. Thank you. You may step
     4
     5
         down. You're excused.
     6
                   (The witness is excused.)
     7
                  THE COURT: We'll take a short recess.
                  Jurors, again, you know what I'm going to say. No
     8
         discussion of the evidence in the case. There will be a time
01:52 10
         for that, but it is certainly not now.
    11
                  We'll take a 15-minute recess.
    12
                  THE CLERK: All rise for the Court and the jury. The
    13
         Court will be in recess.
    14
                   (The Court and jury exit the courtroom and there is a
    15
         recess in the proceedings at 11:54 a.m.)
                  THE CLERK: All rise for the Court.
    16
    17
                   (The Court enters the courtroom at 12:16 p.m.)
                  THE COURT: I understand counsel would like to be
    18
    19
         seen.
02:15 20
                   (Discussion at sidebar and out of the hearing of the
    21
         public:)
    22
                  MR. BRUCK: We move for a mistrial based on the
    23
         testimony of the last witness, Celeste Corcoran. We think it
    24
         was -- you know, partly restating the objections that we
    25
         raised -- have raised consistently and previously concerning
```

02:16 10

02:16 20

what we described as victim impact relating to the survivors, we think that the -- any arguable relevance to any statutory aggravating factor was exceeded by the excessively detailed, excessively graphic and excessively prolonged-in-time testimony. In other words, the testimony went beyond describing her injuries or the risk of death from her injuries and became victim-impact testimony of which we received no statutory notice which is not relevant to any statutory aggravating factor.

The underlying harm that comes from this and where the line was far transgressed by this testimony is that it pressures the jury and induces the jury to sentence the defendant for the murders, for the crimes against these surviving victims. They do not sit as sentences for the injuries to Ms. Corcoran or to any of the amputees or to any of the many people that were injured that did not die; they are sentences only with respect to capital counts which involve homicides. And that is where the line must be drawn and where it was transgressed here.

We think it invites not only a violation of the statutory scheme under the Federal Death Penalty Act but also invites arbitrary decision-making in violation of the Eighth Amendment. There was no possible way that we could have jumped up repeatedly during Ms. Corcoran's testimony without drawing the wrath of the jury, not only upon the lawyer making the

objection, but also vicariously on the defendant.

02:18 20

02:17 10

We had made our objections prior to the testimony. I point out that in addition to all of this, the witness was permitted to give a narrative that went on and on without being interspersed by -- with questions, and across the board this was way over the top. And it is prejudicial and we think requires a mistrial.

If the mistrial should be denied, we are asking that the government be instructed to keep their testimony from this category of witness with far stricter bounds than was true of this last witness if there is any hope of maintaining the focus on the actual capital counts that the law requires.

MR. MELLIN: Your Honor, we disagree. Her testimony was tied to the injuries for herself and her daughter. And explaining all of that, that's important for us to prove the cruel, heinous and depraved manner in which the victims died, in addition to also just proving the grave risk of death to each of these individuals.

I disagree with Mr. Bruck saying that the only thing these jurors are to consider is -- are the decedents. There is a specific aggravating factor tied to the 17 amputees which talks about grave risk of death.

MR. WEINREB: Your Honor, if I may just add one thing. The government does not accept that the defense need not make a real time objection. And if they believe, for example, that a

02:19 20

02:19 10

particular question or -- has pushed -- gone over a line that the Court has drawn, or a motion to strike testimony if they believe it's gone over the line, or, for example, if a witness is giving narrative testimony and they believe that that's improper and more questions should be asked, these are precisely the kinds of objections that need to be made in real time; cannot be made ahead of time. And they are waived if not made.

And the defense's concern that the jury be -- resent them for bringing objections to be dealt with by the Court's instruction to the jury that they should not hold objections against the attorneys. There is nothing different about this case than every other case. No party ever wants to object and be seen as objecting in front of the jury and yet that's part of how trials work in an adversarial system. They're not excepted from it just because they have a special sensitivity to it.

THE COURT: Okay. First, I agree with that general observation. It would be prejudicial to repeatedly stand up and object. I don't think that means you're excused from doing it at least once, because it calls the issue to the Court's attention while it can still be addressed and perhaps remedied. And as a matter of fact, I believe the Supreme Court in Payne actually acknowledged the dilemma, was the word used, but brushed by it, frankly, saying that's a decision you have to

```
1
         make.
                  MR. BRUCK: They're referring there to victim-impact
     2
         testimony. That's not what --
     3
                  THE COURT: And I think it was with respect to how you
     4
     5
         object.
                  As to the substance, I agree, essentially, that it is
         relevant to statutory factors as well as grave risk.
     7
     8
                  MS. CLARKE: So in other words, it would have done no
         good to object?
02:20 10
                  MR. BRUCK: And a great deal of harm.
    11
                  THE COURT: Well, I don't see how that helps.
                  MS. CLARKE: Well, that's what I'm hearing. Because I
    12
    13
         don't want to have to do it to this next witness when the exact
    14
         same kind of --
    15
                  THE COURT: If it's the same ground, yeah. But it
         won't be a basis for a mistrial motion after the testimony
    16
         either. If you think it sometimes -- with each witness it gets
    17
    18
         worse and, therefore, may support more radical action, then I
    19
         think you do have to call it out and it can be headed off.
02:21 20
                  MS. CLARKE: Can the government be instructed not to
    21
         allow the witness to go on with a narration as opposed to
    22
         answering the question?
    23
                  THE COURT: Well, that's a whole different area. And
    24
         I noticed that myself, actually, that she was going on a little
    25
         bit.
```

1 MS. CLARKE: That's Mr. Mellin's specialty. 2 MR. MELLIN: Narration is my specialty? THE COURT: Watch it. I do agree with that objection. 3 MR. MELLIN: Excuse me. 4 5 MS. CLARKE: The confrontation clause. 6 MR. BRUCK: We also want to renew the point that the 7 confrontation clause is violated to the extent the testimony is relevant to an eligibility factor and invokes hearsay or 8 testimony absent witness cross-examination. We want a 02:21 10 continuing objection to anything --11 THE COURT: Well, I don't think you can have a 12 continuing objection on that basis. It will have to be made 13 when hearsay is offered. 14 MS. CONRAD: Your Honor, could we have a continuing 15 objection to the government eliciting testimony about the impact on the surviving victims of their injuries? Because 16 what I hear your Honor saying --17 18 THE COURT: Well, it has multiple purposes, this 19 evidence. You're seeing it as the bad purpose that you think 02:22 20 is objectionable, they're seeing it as legitimate purposes 21 under the statute, including supporting some alleged statutory 22 aggravating factors. That --23 MS. CONRAD: I didn't hear anything about grave risk 24 of death. I only raise this when she talked about her hearing 25 loss. I didn't hear about grave risk of death when she talked

```
1
         about the scars that her daughter has on her. I didn't hear
     2
         about grave risk of death when she talked about how upset she
         was that she couldn't go to help her daughter when she was
     3
         violently ill in the hospital. So I don't see how that's grave
     4
     5
         anything other than victim impact.
     6
                  But I'm just saying they're offering something that
     7
         doesn't address grave risk of death or heinous or depraved,
         that -- as to that, we have a continuing objection.
     8
     9
                  MR. WEINREB: And, your Honor, I would just like to
02:23 10
         add not every word out of a defendant's mouth has to be
    11
         directly --
    12
                  THE COURT: Out of a witness's mouth.
    13
                  MR. WEINREB: I'm sorry. Out of a witness's mouth has
    14
         to be directly relevant to a factor. They're allowed to give
    15
         some narration and context to what they're saying so the jury
         can understand the situation when the issue arises. That's why
    16
         real time objections are needed.
    17
    18
                  THE COURT: I agree. Right. Okay.
    19
                   (In open court:)
                  THE CLERK: All rise for the jury.
02:24 20
    21
                   (The jury enters the courtroom at 12:27 p.m.)
    22
                  THE CLERK: Be seated.
    23
                  THE COURT: Mr. Chakravarty.
    24
                  MR. CHAKRAVARTY: Thank you, your Honor.
                                                             The
    25
         government calls Gillian Reny.
```

## GILLIAN RENY, duly sworn

- THE CLERK: Have a seat. State your name, spell your
- 3 last name for the record, keep your voice up and speak into the
- 4 mic so everyone can hear you, okay?
- 5 THE WITNESS: Gillian Reny, R-E-N-Y.
- 6 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 7 BY MR. CHAKRAVARTY:
- Q. Good afternoon. How old are you?
- 9 A. I'm 20 years old.
- 02:27 10 Q. And where do you live?
  - 11 A. I live in Boston, Massachusetts.
  - 12 | Q. And are you in college?
  - 13 A. Yeah, I'm a sophomore at the University of Pennsylvania.
  - 14 Q. And are you just back for the weekend, essentially?
  - 15 A. Yeah. I'm back for the weekend. My family ran the
  - 16 marathon yesterday.
  - 17 Q. Is that a family tradition?
  - 18 A. Yes. My family has been running the marathon for years.
  - 19 Each of my parents have run five now, and my sister has run
- 02:27 20 three.

- 21 Q. Your sister Danielle?
- 22 A. Yeah, my sister Danielle.
- 23 | Q. Do you live with -- or before you went to college, did you
- 24 live with all of them in Boston?
- 25 A. Yes, we all lived in Boston together.

- 1 Q. So how long -- for how long has the Boston Marathon been a
- 2 tradition in your family?
- 3 A. I mean, ever since I can remember. We live in downtown
- 4 Boston so it's hard to not feel the excitement of the city on
- 5 that day. Like I said, each of my parents have run it multiple
- 6 times, and so we always would go -- I'd follow them along the
- 7 course and ultimately end at the finish line, and then kind of
- 8 meander back over to our house.
- 9 Q. About how many times do you think you've been to the
- 02:28 10 | marathon?
  - 11 A. I'd say at least ten.
  - 12 | Q. And for the 2013 Boston Marathon, did you attend that day?
  - 13 A. Yes, I did.
  - 14 Q. Who was running that day?
  - 15 A. My older sister, Danielle, was running. It was her first
  - 16 marathon.
  - 17 Q. Were your parents running?
  - 18 A. No, my parents were not running. We were all following
  - 19 her along the course. We started in Natick, and then we went
- 02:28 20 | to my friend's house in Newton, and then we ended up at the
  - 21 finish line.
  - 22 Q. Was this the first time that you had actually attended
  - 23 | with both of your parents?
  - 24 A. Yeah, it was the first time I'd been with both of my
  - 25 parents.

- Q. And who else from your family, aside from your parents, was attending?
- 3 A. My sister was running with a friend of hers from Harvard,
- 4 so we were with her mother who had flown in from California; we
- 5 | were with -- my uncle was running as well. So we were with my
- 6 grandmother and my sister's boyfriend, Kyle, as well as my
- 7 cousins. However, in Newton we split up into two different
- 8 cars. My aunt's family lives in the South End, so they went to
- 9 the other side of Boylston, and we live in Beacon Hill, so we
- 02:29 10 | went to the opposite side. So I was standing with my mother,
  - 11 my father, my sister's boyfriend, my grandmother and my
  - 12 sister's friend's mother.
  - 13 Q. And who was on the side of Boylston Street?
  - 14 A. Right across from us, we were actually kind of looking at
  - each other, was my grandfather, my aunt, and her two young
  - 16 daughters.
  - 17 Q. And about what time did you arrive at the finish line
  - 18 area?
  - 19 A. We arrived around 2:15, and we first saw my uncle cross,
- 02:30 20 and then we were waiting for my sister.
  - 21 Q. And you said that you're 20 now?
  - 22 A. Yup.
  - 23 Q. How old were you on April 15, 2013?
  - 24 A. I was 18. I was just finishing my senior year of high
  - 25 school.

- 1 Q. Around what time did your Uncle Bill cross the finish
- 2 line?
- A. I think he finished around, maybe, 2:30, a little before
- 4 then, maybe.
- 5 | Q. And how close were you to the finish line itself?
- 6 A. We were -- I remember because my mom had sent a text to my
- 7 | father and my sister's boyfriend who were parking the car, we
- 8 were standing right out between Marathon Sports and
- 9 LensCrafters.
- 02:31 10 Q. And what was the atmosphere like?
  - 11 A. I mean, it was so exciting. It was -- everyone was
  - 12 celebrating everyone crossing the finish line. We'd just seen
  - 13 my uncle. It was definitely really exciting to be there.
  - 14 Q. Around that time when your uncle crossed, how far away did
  - 15 you understand that your sister was from coming?
  - 16 A. So she was close behind. I think she was around ten
  - 17 minutes. I remember we got a text from a friend who was
  - 18 | further up Boylston shortly before the bombs went off saying
  - 19 that she had just passed them.
- 02:31 20 MR. CHAKRAVARTY: I'm going to call up Exhibit 1594,
  - 21 your Honor, which has just been admitted into evidence.
  - 22 Q. Ms. Reny, do you recognize these people over here?
  - 23 A. Yup. That's my mother, and my father standing behind her.
  - 24 Q. Okay. Can you just circle them by touching the screen?
  - 25 A. (Witness complies.)

- 1 Q. And "Audrey" is your mother's name?
- 2 A. Yeah, "Audrey."
- 3 Q. And do you now know who these people are?
- 4 A. Yup. And the woman standing in front of them is Amanda
- 5 North, who is my sister's friend's mother.
- 6 Q. Okay. So Amanda was with you that morning?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. And who are the people behind her?
- 9 A. That's Krystle Campbell and her friend Karen.
- 02:33 10 Q. And is this where -- where were you in this picture, or
  - 11 are you in this picture?
  - 12 A. I believe I was standing right behind my dad, but I'm a
  - 13 bit shorter than him so you can't see me.
  - 14 MR. CHAKRAVARTY: Can we go to Exhibit 18, please.
  - 15 Also in evidence, your Honor.
  - 16 Q. Now, this is a different angle. And again, do you see
  - 17 Krystle Campbell and Karen Rand/Karen McWatters?
  - 18 | A. Yes.
  - 19 Q. Can you see any part of yourself in this picture?
- 02:33 20 A. Yeah, that's my hair right behind the man with the
  - 21 sunglasses, who is my sister's boyfriend.
  - 22 Q. I'm sorry. Go ahead and circle it.
  - 23 A. Oh, sorry.
  - 24 Q. And the man behind you, that's --
  - 25 A. Kyle, my sister's boyfriend.

1 And so is that where you were standing right before the bombs went off? 2 Yeah. 3 Α. MR. CHAKRAVARTY: Thank you, Mr. Bruemmer. 4 5 Q. What do you remember when the bombs went off? 6 Well, like I said, my -- we had just received a text that 7 my sister was on Boylston and she was about to cross, so my dad actually just had turned on his video camera to get prepared at 8 this point. We'd been standing there, like I said, since 02:34 10 around 2:15, so we were towards the front, towards the fence. 11 And I just remember, like, silence, like. I mean, I had no idea what was going on. It felt like I was in a movie, it 12 13 was a joke. I had no idea what was going on. And there was 14 like just a complete, utter, like, chilling silence and then just chaos. Chaos like I have never seen and would hope to 15 16 never see ever again. I fell onto the ground. Luckily, I had been pushed by the 17 18 force into my mom. And I looked down at my legs, and there was 19 so much blood. My tibia had been completely snapped in half 02:35 20 and was sticking out of my legs. Muscle was everywhere. was the most horrifying image I could ever imagine. And to see 21 22 that on my own body was terrifying. Luckily, I was with my mom, and shortly after my dad found us. He held on to my --23 24 Let me stop you there before we get to that. And there's

some water in front of you, and also tissues if you want.

- A. Thank you.
- 2 Q. After you were moved by the force of the blast, did
- 3 | you -- you said you couldn't hear anything. Could you smell
- 4 anything?

- 5 A. Yeah. It was very smokey, like just a burning smell
- 6 everywhere. Intoxicating. It smelled awful. And the smoke
- 7 had settled around. You -- it was very foggy, just very
- 8 chaotic.
- 9 Q. You were just describing that you had looked down. Before
- 02:36 10 you looked down, did you look around to see what happened?
  - 11 A. Well, my leg was completely torn apart, so I remember
  - 12 almost for that little, like, silence, I just was sort of like
  - 13 in shock. And then I had nothing to stand on so I kind
  - 14 of -- my body crumbled to the ground but I -- I remember
  - 15 looking around and that there just seemed like bodies
  - 16 everywhere, blood everywhere. People who were coming over to
  - 17 help, screaming and crying, and just so -- distress amongst
  - 18 everyone.
  - 19 Q. Did you feel anything coming from the pavement?
- 02:37 20 A. It was really hot. It was -- I was wearing a fleece, and
  - 21 | I remember at one point being so hot I sort of took it off, but
  - 22 | I don't -- I didn't even realize how hurt I was until I felt
  - 23 the ground and looked down at my legs, or what was left of
  - 24 them.
  - 25 | Q. What did you see when you looked at your legs?

- 1 A. My tibia was completely snapped in half. I had lost a
- 2 | large amount of bone and muscle. My lower leg on my right side
- 3 | was completely torn apart, and my left leg was also severely
- 4 damaged. Just so much blood. It was horrifying to look down
- 5 and see that that was your own body.
- 6 Q. Was there blood where you were?
- 7 A. Yeah, blood was pooling around where I was laying.
- 8 Q. Could you tell whether it was your blood or somebody
- 9 else's?
- 02:39 10 A. There was too much blood to know.
  - 11 Q. Was it one leg or both legs?
  - 12 A. It was both my legs, but my right was significantly worse
  - 13 off than my left.
  - 14 Q. Where was the injury on your leg?
  - 15 A. It was in my lower -- beneath my knees, my right tibia.
  - 16 So lower -- like my shin area.
  - 17 Q. And on the other leg, on the left leg?
  - 18 A. The same.
  - 19 Q. Could you see your left leg -- the muscle of your left
- 02:39 20 leg? Excuse me.
  - 21 A. Yes. The muscle of my left leg was like flapping over
  - 22 the -- my shredded jeans.
  - 23 Q. Were you bleeding?
  - 24 A. Yes, enormously. Looking down at the blood, I was shocked
  - 25 that that much blood could come out of someone. I felt so,

- like, weak, and I was terrified that I was going to die. I die
  not know that you could be that injured and survive. And I
  also was 100 percent certain that my right leg was gone
  entirely. It felt completely disconnected from my body. And
  the pain that I was experiencing was something that I wouldn't
  wish on anyone in a million years. It's difficult to explain
- 8 Q. Did people come to help you?
- Yeah. Like I mentioned before, my grandfather was across 02:40 10 the street, and when he saw -- I mean, we were looking at each 11 other. And when he saw it go off, he sent my aunt and my cousins away and he ran across the street and he -- he held 12 13 onto my left leg, and my father, who ended up finding us, held 14 onto my right leg. And then after a little, a man came over and helped us as well. He was previously in the Army, so he 15 took control. And he had my dad give -- take off his belt to 16 tie and make a tourniquet, and he took off his belt as well to 17 make a tourniquet on my other leg. 18

because it's not like anything I've ever felt before.

- 19 Q. So you had tourniquets on both legs?
- 02:41 20 A. Yes.

- 21 Q. Were your parents injured as well?
- A. They were injured, but at the time I had no idea. And I'm so glad that I had no idea because I would have been worrying
- 24 about them as well.
- 25 Q. Did you lose consciousness while you were on Boylston

- 1 Street?
- 2 A. No, unfortunately.
- 3 Q. And the pain you felt, did that continue for as long as it
- 4 took for you to get to the hospital?
- 5 A. Yeah. I expected to pass out. I guess movies are not
- 6 accurate in that sense. But I was then transported onto some
- 7 sort of lifting board.
- 8 Q. A board to put you on -- before we get to that, I wanted
- 9 to show you some more images from the scene and ask you if you
- 02:42 10 recognize it.
  - 11 A. (Nonverbal response.)
  - MR. CHAKRAVARTY: I would ask to publish Exhibit 12,
  - 13 which is in evidence, your Honor.
  - 14 Q. Do you see yourself in this picture?
  - 15 A. Yeah.
  - 16 Q. Would you please just circle yourself?
  - 17 A. (Witness complies.)
  - 18 Q. And who is that leaning over you?
  - 19 A. That's my grandmother.
- 02:43 20 Q. And do you see your mother in this picture as well?
  - 21 A. Yeah.
  - 22 Q. Can you just circle her?
  - 23 A. (Witness complies.)
  - 24 Q. And were you standing right next to Krystle Campbell? You
  - 25 can see her as well?

- 1 A. (No verbal response.)
- 2 MR. CHAKRAVARTY: Go to Exhibit 16, please.
- 3 Q. And again, can you see your mother here?
- 4 A. Yeah.
- 5 | Q. And this is -- appears to be a short time later. And are
- 6 you apparently behind the woman with the green jacket on in the
- 7 foreground?
- 8 A. Yeah.
- 9 Q. So when you fell, you said you crumbled. Did you try to
- 02:44 10 move?
  - 11 A. No, it hurt much too badly to move. I remember my father,
  - 12 when he came over to help, he took off his jacket, I think it
  - was his jacket, and kind of was trying to preserve what was
  - 14 | left of my leg off the sidewalk. And he moved it, obviously
  - 15 up, to try to get the jacket underneath, and it was
  - 16 excruciating pain, even worse than what I was feeling when I
  - 17 | was just laying there. So after that, they were trying as best
  - 18 they could to keep me, like, as still as possible.
  - 19 Q. When you were in that pain, did you scream?
- 02:45 20 A. Yes.
  - 21 Q. Did you hear screaming around you?
  - 22 A. Yes.
  - 23 Q. Did I show you a video from that day? Does that fairly
  - 24 and accurately portray both the audio as well as the video of
  - 25 | what was happening around you?

```
1
         Α.
              Yes.
     2
                  MR. CHAKRAVARTY: At this point I would request to
     3
         publish Exhibit 11B, which was previously admitted.
                  MS. CLARKE: Subject to our previous objection.
     4
     5
                  THE COURT: Your objection is preserved.
     6
                   (Video recording with audio played.)
     7
         BY MR. CHAKRAVARTY:
     8
             Is that you, Ms. Reny?
         A. (Nonverbal response.)
02:47 10
                  MR. CHAKRAVARTY: Your Honor, I have two photos just
    11
         to show the witness.
                  1631, please.
    12
    13
         O. What's that?
    14
         A. That's me, and my mom holding me.
    15
             1632?
         Q.
         A. That's me and my mom as well.
    16
    17
                  MR. CHAKRAVARTY: I'd move 1631 and 1632 into
    18
         evidence.
    19
                  MS. CLARKE: Same objection, your Honor.
02:47 20
                  THE COURT: Can I see 1631 again? Do you need both of
    21
         them?
    22
                  MR. CHAKRAVARTY: No, your Honor.
    23
                  THE COURT: 1632.
    24
                  MR. CHAKRAVARTY: Thank you.
    25
                  THE COURT: 1631 will be excluded.
```

```
(Government Exhibit No. 1632 received into evidence.)
     1
     2
                  MR. CHAKRAVARTY: Request to publish, your Honor.
         BY MR. CHAKRAVARTY:
     3
              Ms. Reny, we saw on the photos that your mother was on one
     5
         side of you. Is now she leaning right over on top of you?
         Α.
               (Nonverbal response.)
     7
              How quickly were you transported from the scene?
         Ο.
              I've been told that I was one of the first.
         Α.
                   MS. CLARKE: Objection.
02:48 10
                  THE COURT: Why don't you start again.
    11
                  MR. CHAKRAVARTY: I'll revisit.
    12
         BY MR. CHAKRAVARTY:
    13
              Were you transported from the scene?
         0.
    14
         Α.
              Yes.
    15
              Was it shortly after what the photos depict?
             Yes; I was towards the front.
    16
         Α.
              Were you closest to the fence line?
    17
         Ο.
    18
              Yes, I was almost in the front.
         Α.
    19
         Q.
              You were starting to say before I interrupted with the
02:49 20
         pictures that you were placed on a board. Can you explain what
    21
         happened?
    22
              Shortly after, I was placed on a board to transport me
    23
         into the ambulance. And so once they had put me on the board,
    24
         they put me in an ambulance with another person who had been
    25
         seriously injured, and my parents came in as well.
```

```
1
              And you went to the hospital?
              Yeah, I was transported to Brigham and Women's.
     2
              Were you -- did you have the same concerns that you had
     3
         Q.
         when you were out on Boylston Street once you made it to the
     5
         hospital?
                  MS. CLARKE: Objection.
     7
                  THE COURT: Overruled.
     8
                  You may answer.
     9
                   THE WITNESS: As I was being transported to the
02:50 10
         hospital, I was still extremely nervous about my outcome.
    11
         was feeling more hopeful that I was going to make it, but I had
         lost pretty much all about my leg being salvaged. But getting
    12
    13
         to the hospital was definitely -- I did feel some more
    14
         security.
    15
         BY MR. CHAKRAVARTY:
              Did you undergo several surgeries in the hospital?
    16
              Yeah, I was in the emergency room and then immediately
    17
         transported to an initial surgery, and then I was placed under
    18
    19
         a medical-induced coma for a few days while they figured out a
02:50 20
         treatment plan. And then a few days later I went -- I
         underwent a surgery that -- they had first planned on doing a
    21
    22
         series of surgeries over the next few weeks, but because I was
    23
         young and the risk of infection --
    24
                  MS. CLARKE: Objection.
```

THE COURT: Overruled.

1

2

3

5

7

8

9

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

25

02:52 20

02:51 10

```
THE WITNESS: -- was so high, they were able to do one
extremely long surgery and accomplish pretty much most of what
they wanted to do.
BY MR. CHAKRAVARTY:
     In addition to the risk of infection, was there another
concern that the doctors had about the complications?
         MS. CLARKE: Objection.
         THE COURT: Overruled.
         THE WITNESS: They were able to salvage my leg but
they were unclear as to its function and whether it would be
successful for weeks, and actually months after.
BY MR. CHAKRAVARTY:
    And just in lay terms, what is limb salvage?
     Basically, instead of amputating, they -- I had one vein
that was a major connecting vein between my foot and the rest
of my leg that was miraculously intact, so because of that they
went and tried to go down the road of saving my whole leg,
which is sort of, like, limb salvage.
Q.
     How much flesh was connecting the lower part of your leg
to the top part of your leg?
     Hardly any. My bone was entirely exposed, and I had lost
a lot of bone as well. So in order to repair, they had to take
sections of my abdomen to use to cover my leg and use as a
makeshift -- non-functioning but makeshift muscle.
Q.
    Did they put a blood filter in you as well?
```

- A. Yeah, they put a in filter because the risk of blood clotting was extremely high.
- 3 Q. Did they harvest tissue from various parts of your body
- for those procedures?
- 5 A. Yeah. Like I said, my abdomen, as well as skin, because I
- 6 had lost enormous amounts of skin on both my left and right
- 7 legs.
- Q. From your observations over the -- both your time on
  Boylston Street as well as in the hospital, did you understand
  what happened, the mechanism of your injury, how you got hurt?
  - 11 A. Yes. If you look at my legs, a piece of the bomb went
  - 12 straight through. So while it mostly hit my right leg, which
  - is what broke it, it did hit the left as well. So it just kind
  - of went straight through. And that's what I was told.
  - 15 Q. How long were you in the hospital?
  - 16 A. Six weeks.
  - 17 Q. Do you still have chunks of your leg that are missing?
  - 18 A. Yes.
  - MR. CHAKRAVARTY: Thank you.
- 02:54 20 THE COURT: Okay?
  - MS. CLARKE: Thank you very much. No questions.
  - 22 THE COURT: All right, Ms. Reny. Thank you. You may
  - 23 step down.
  - We'll take the lunch recess at this stage.
  - 25 THE CLERK: All rise for the Court and the jury. The

```
Court will take the luncheon recess.
     1
     2
                   (The Court and jury exit the courtroom and there is a
     3
         recess in the proceedings at 12:56 p.m.)
     4
                   THE CLERK: All rise for the Court and the jury.
     5
                   (The Court and jury enter the courtroom at 2:08 p.m.)
     6
                   THE CLERK: Be seated.
     7
                   THE COURT: Ms. Pellegrini.
                   MS. PELLEGRINI: Thank you, your Honor. The United
     8
         States calls William Campbell III.
04:07 10
                         WILLIAM CAMPBELL III, duly sworn
                   THE CLERK: State your name, spell your last name for
    11
         the record, keep your voice up and speak into the mic so
    12
    13
         everyone can hear you.
    14
                   THE WITNESS: William Campbell III, C-A-M-P-B-E-L-L.
    15
                                 DIRECT EXAMINATION
         BY MS. PELLEGRINI:
    16
              And, Mr. Campbell, will you tell the jury what town you
    17
    18
         live in.
    19
         Α.
              Medford, Massachusetts.
04:08 20
         Q.
              And who resides with you?
    21
             My parents.
         Α.
    22
         Q.
              And who are your parents?
    23
              William Campbell, Jr., and Patricia Campbell.
         Α.
    24
         Q.
              And anybody else?
    25
         Α.
              No, just -- no, just them.
```

- 1 Q. All right. And, Mr. Campbell, your sister was Krystle
- 2 Campbell, correct?
- 3 A. Correct.
- 4 Q. And tell us about, first of all, the age difference
- 5 between you two.
- 6 A. Two years age difference between us.
- 7 Q. And you're older?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. All right. And even though you're older, what was it like
- 04:08 10 growing up with Krystle?
  - 11 A. It was great. She was my sister. I mean, I don't know.
  - 12 We had a lot of fun together. We liked to hang out. And we
  - were friends more than brother and sister for most parts. She
  - 14 | was always there for me and I was there for her. It was just
  - 15 how we worked.
  - 16 Q. All right. Now, sometimes brothers and sisters don't get
  - 17 along, so what made your relationship work?
  - 18 | A. I think it was, like, right around when we became
  - 19 teenagers and stuff and we just had more things in common.
- 04:09 20 And, you know, when I had my low day, she would be there for me
  - 21 and we would tease each other or just, you know, if I was
  - 22 | having a bad day, Okay. Let's go out and do something. Let's
  - 23 get out of the situation. Let's make the day better, you know.
  - 24 So we did.
  - 25 Q. And what are the things that you had in common?

- 1 A. We liked to go out, we liked dancing. We just had fun. I
- 2 mean, we liked being around people. And it was good. We just
- 3 knew how to enjoy whatever we were doing at the time.
- 4 Q. What was your earliest memory of Krystle?
- 5 A. Probably when we were real little, I mean, either getting
- 6 in trouble with my parents or just fighting over the remote to
- 7 the TV. I mean, simple things. Playing video games.
  - Q. Now, did you attend the same schools?
- 9 A. We did for the most part, yes.
- 04:10 10 Q. All right. And how was that, having, you know, a sibling
  - in the same school?
  - 12 A. It had its ups and downs. I mean, sometimes, you know,
  - 13 it's like "Why are you hanging out with my friends?" and stuff
  - 14 like that when we were younger. It was good. When we were
  - 15 older, I mean, we went to different schools and stuff like that
  - 16 around high school time and it was a little bit different. It
  - 17 | was good. It was fun. We had mutual friends, so...
  - 18 Q. And were you able to observe Krystle's relationship with
  - 19 your folks?
- 04:10 20 A. Yeah.
  - 21 Q. What was that like?
  - 22 A. It was good. She always was -- spoke up if there was
  - 23 something -- you know, we'd get in trouble for something, and
  - 24 she was always explaining why she did this or that before even
  - 25 | I would. I would just be, like, "Okay. I know I messed up.

- 1 I'm just going to go over here," and she would argue the fact.
- 2 Q. All right. And, Mr. Campbell, tell us about Krystle's
- 3 work and work experience and her work ethic.
- 4 A. She was a hard worker, much more than I ever was. She
- 5 pushed herself to do everything she did. She wouldn't let
- 6 people hold her down or tell her that she couldn't do
- 7 | something, whether it was schoolwork, whether it was -- you
- 8 know, making a career for herself. She just really knew how to
- 9 not listen to people who were trying to hold her back and just
- 04:11 10 push forward to be who she was and just to accomplish what she
  - 11 set her goals to.
  - 12 Q. And how about her education? What did she do to further
  - 13 her own education?
  - 14 A. She went to college. She, you know, did the college
  - 15 thing. I never did myself, so I don't -- but she just studied
  - 16 hard, you know? A lot of the schooling didn't come as easy but
  - 17 she pushed through and she got the help she needed, and that's
  - 18 what she did.
  - 19 Q. Do you know how she got through college; that is, who paid
- 04:12 20 for it?
  - 21 A. Herself.
  - 22 Q. How did she do that?
  - 23 A. Applying for financial aid, just working a lot, and
  - 24 just -- I mean, she's been working since she's been 14. She's
  - 25 | never stopped. On top of school and everything. She just

- 1 pulled her own weight. She didn't have handouts or anything.
- 2 | She just pushed her way through.
- 3 Q. And you said she'd been working since she was 14. What
- 4 kinds of jobs did she hold?
- 5 A. Mostly food service, restaurant industry. Whether it was
- 6 waitressing, you know, bussing, whatever. I mean, I don't know
- 7 | what the ground level stuff is. She started working before I
- 8 did.
- 9 Q. All right. And did she continue in that field?
- 04:12 10 A. She did.
  - 11 Q. All right. And tell us what you know about the jobs that
  - 12 she held.
  - 13 A. Mostly it was waitressing, and then as she got more
  - 14 through college it became more into the management field, and
  - 15 to progress forward in that type of food industry and
  - 16 management.
  - 17 Q. And what kind of things did she do as manager for the food
  - 18 service?
  - 19 A. You name it, I mean, she's done it. Whether it was
- 04:13 20 | running events, whether it was setting up things for, you know,
  - 21 anywhere from weddings to a birthday party, she took care of
  - 22 that. She handled it. She was the go-to person.
  - 23 Q. Mr. Campbell, one of things you said you liked to do was
  - 24 go to dances together and things like that. Did you share a
  - 25 common interest in music?

- 1 A. Yeah, for the most -- I mean, we liked all types. I mean,
- 2 it really didn't take much to have us go and join, you know,
- 3 | wherever we were with each other. We'd just have a few laughs
- 4 and then we'd end up dancing. It's just how it was. I don't
- 5 know.
- 6 Q. How about other sports?
- 7 A. I mean, we went to sporting events and stuff like that,
- 8 but she played baseball and -- when she was younger and things.
- 9 She was really big into sports teams and...
- 04:14 10 Q. And how about things like skiing and swimming?
  - 11 A. Yeah. She was more of a skier. I liked to snow-board.
  - 12 | We'd gone on many trips and had good times.
  - 13 Q. Were those family trips?
  - 14 A. Some were. I mean, we went up to my uncle's house a few
  - 15 times. He has a place over in Mansfield, and when we could use
  - 16 it, we did.
  - 17 Q. Mr. Campbell, how would you describe the relationship --
  - 18 Krystle's relationship with other family members, other than
  - 19 you and your mom and your dad?
- 04:14 20 A. She was just the centerpiece. I mean, she could talk to
  - 21 anybody. She stayed close to every relative: aunt, uncle, my
  - 22 grandparents. She just really took good care of her family and
  - 23 | always made sure that -- regardless of how busy she was with
  - 24 work and schooling -- everybody around her was all right.
  - 25 Q. How did she keep in touch with folks?

- 1 A. Whether it was a phone call or whether it was a random
- 2 visit, whether it was just, "I wonder how this person is doing
- 3 today." She just wanted to see how people were and make sure
- 4 they were okay and...
- 5 Q. Now, Mr. Campbell, you have a son?
- 6 A. Ido.
- 7 O. And how old is he now?
- 8 A. He's six years old.
- 9 Q. And tell us about Krystle's relationship with your son.
- 04:15 10 A. She loved my son. I mean, she would have done anything
  - 11 for him. She was just a great aunt. And, you know, even with
  - 12 her work schedule and being as hectic as it was, she always
  - 13 | made time for him whenever she could see him.
  - 14 Q. And your son, tell us about him and how he felt about
  - 15 Krystle.
  - 16 A. My son -- my son loved his aunt. He would go over and
  - 17 give her a hug and play little games. He's like, you know,
  - 18 it's...
  - 19 Q. Did he do that with everybody?
- 04:15 20 A. No, my son doesn't necessarily come off -- you've got
  - 21 | to -- you've got to work your way into my son sometimes because
  - 22 he's a little standoffish at first, but once he knows you and
  - 23 he cares, it's pretty simple for him to show his affection.
  - 24 Q. And, Mr. Campbell, what's your favorite memory of Krystle?
  - 25 A. My favorite memory? Just her always -- I mean, I don't

- 1 know if it would be a favorite, it's just a feeling that I
- 2 always had when I was with my sister. It was more that I just
- 3 always knew that I had somebody there for me regardless of the
- 4 circumstances. And those memories are the most fond of mine,
- 5 knowing that if I was having a bad day or whatever, I just was
- 6 a phone call away before, you know, I could just have somebody
- 7 to talk to.
- 8 Q. And when's the last time you saw Krystle?
- 9 A. I seen her the Saturday before the marathon.
- 04:16 10 | Q. What did you guys do?
  - 11 A. We went to the Square One Mall and we just did some
  - 12 | shopping. I had my son with me. I bought him a new toy. And
  - 13 it was simply that, you know.
  - 14 Q. And on Marathon Monday of 2013, first of all, did you know
  - 15 where Krystle was that day?
  - 16 A. I wasn't 100 percent sure where she was but I had an idea
  - 17 | where she was.
  - 18 Q. What was your idea?
  - 19 A. I didn't know if she was at the Red Sox game or if she was
- 04:17 20 | watching the marathon. I knew it was one or the other, though.
  - 21 | Q. And did there come a time when you heard about the
  - 22 | bombings on Boylston Street?
  - 23 A. There was. I heard it over the radio.
  - 24 Q. And what did you do?
  - 25 A. I had a mini panic attack. I mean, I just was worried.

- So, you know, I'm not supposed to use my phone on the floor but
- 2 I ran out and called her anyway, and there was no answer.
- 3 Nobody picked up. And I kept calling and --
- 4 Q. What happened?
- 5 A. Eventually I got a phone call back from her number and I
- 6 was relieved and I thought everything was fine. And I found
- 7 out that it was just a nurse saying that my sister was among
- 8 one of the victims. And I just left work. I told my boss,
- 9 "I'm leaving," and then I grabbed my mother because she works
- 04:17 10 in -- close to my job as well, and we just went to the hospital
  - 11 where we thought she was.
  - 12 Q. What happened when you got there?
  - 13 A. We had to wait. And at first they told me everything was
  - 14 | fine, that she was going to survive and, you know, she would
  - 15 have problems with her leg for probably the rest of her life
  - 16 but she was alive. And I was relieved. I was calling family
  - 17 members, telling them she's going to be okay and it's going to
  - 18 be all right. She's going to have a tough road ahead of her
  - 19 but she's going to be fine.
- 04:18 20 And then it was just more waiting for her to get out of
  - 21 surgery. We thought that was her in surgery. And it wasn't
  - 22 until about four-thirty in the morning, four o'clock when we
  - found out that it wasn't my sister; it was a mistaken identity.
  - 24 Q. Did you know who the person was who actually was in
  - 25 surgery?

- A. I was not allowed in the room at that time, but I had an idea that it was her friend Karen Rand.
- 3 Q. And what did you finally find out about Krystle?
- A. We all kind of left because obviously it wasn't my sister,
  and then slowly a homicide detective came up. And I just kind
  of told my parents, you know, this is not -- kind of expect the
  worse, because normally a homicide detective doesn't show up
  unless it's -- I didn't know what it was. And then we just
- 9 were told. We were shown the photo. And we were just in shock 04:19 10 and disbelief after the day we'd had.
  - Q. And, Billy, what was it like for you to learn that Krystle was gone?
  - 13 A. It wasn't real at first. It was just something's wrong.
  - 14 This can't be true. This isn't real. Like you just were
  - 15 stunned. You didn't sleep. You were just trying to
  - 16 rationalize everything in your own mind, trying to make any
  - 17 type of reason. Maybe there was another mistaken identity,
  - maybe there was -- just anything you could tell yourself to
  - 19 calm yourself down at that point.
- 04:19 20 Q. And as time went on, how did you deal with it?
  - 21 A. I had a hard time dealing with it. I went to bad places.
  - 22 I didn't do probably the right things. But I just eventually
  - 23 | had to deal with it. I had to deal with it for my family, I
  - 24 | had to deal with it for my son. I just eventually had to
  - 25 accept the facts.

- Q. And how did your family react?
- 2 A. They were horrified. I mean, there was crying. It was
- 3 emotional. You don't know what to say, you don't know what to
- 4 do. There's this heightened state of panic and you don't know
- 5 what to say. You don't know what's comforting. You're trying
- 6 to comfort somebody else while you, yourself, need comforting.
- 7 You're just lost.

- 8 Q. And since that time two years ago, what's it been like --
- 9 or what's it like now for your family without Krystle?
- 04:20 10 A. It's tough. It's still tough. Every day, you know, we
  - 11 still think about her. She's -- not a day goes by when she
  - doesn't pop into your head at least in some aspect. I think
  - 13 the hardest time I had was trying not to pick up my phone every
  - 14 time I wanted to call her if I'd run into some friends or
  - 15 something. I think that was the hardest thing to get over,
  - 16 just not being able to make that phone call anymore.
  - 17 Q. And for your mom and dad?
  - 18 A. They still struggle with it daily. You know, they have
  - 19 their okay days and then they have their bad days. I mean...
- 04:21 20 Q. Now, Mr. Campbell, before you came into the courtroom
  - 21 today, did you review some photographs with me?
  - 22 A. Yes, I did.
  - 23 Q. And these photographs, did you, in fact -- were these
  - 24 | photographs provided to the United States Attorney's Office and
  - 25 the FBI by your family?

```
1
         Α.
              Yes, I believe most of them are, yeah.
              And you've looked at these and you're in some of them?
     2
         Q.
     3
         Α.
              Yes.
              And you recognize the others that you're not in?
     4
         Q.
     5
         Α.
              Yes.
         Q.
              And you recognize those as being of your sister Krystle?
     7
         Α.
              Yes.
     8
              And these are -- fairly and accurately depict the
         Q.
         situation going on when the photograph was taken?
04:21 10
         Α.
             Yes.
    11
         Q. All right.
    12
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: Your Honor, the government would
    13
         offer and ask to enter Exhibits 1601, -03, -04, -15, -17, -19,
    14
         -21, -23, -24 and -28.
    15
                  THE COURT: Is there any --
                  MS. CLARKE: Your Honor, as the Court knows, we saw
    16
         them in a different format, so I have no idea.
    17
    18
                  THE COURT: Have you shown this group to counsel?
    19
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: This is from the same group, your
04:22 20
         Honor.
    21
                  THE COURT: I understand, but do they know which ones?
    22
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: Yes. This is the group, actually.
    23
                  (Pause.)
    24
                  MS. CLARKE: May we approach?
    25
                  THE COURT: I'll see you.
```

```
1
                   (Discussion at sidebar and out of the hearing of the
     2
         jury:)
     3
                  THE COURT: Is this this witness's son?
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: Yes.
     4
     5
                  MS. CLARKE: Well, you know, I don't know that photos
     6
         No. 1 and 2 meet the Court's prescription. I can understand
     7
         family photos, that he would describe an event, and his child.
         It's hard to tell what the photo on the beach and the -- I take
     8
         it that's him. And then I don't have a clue what the photo
04:24 10
         with her in the dress with a drink.
    11
                  THE COURT: Probably better for the record to refer to
    12
         it by the number.
    13
                  MS. CLARKE: Other than this photo and that photo?
    14
                  THE COURT: Yeah.
                  MS. CLARKE: So 1601, -03 and -04, I don't know
    15
         whether that's him or whether he has memories of those to talk
    16
         about. The ones that don't seem to connect to what the Court
    17
         ruled in chambers are 1601, -21, -23 and -28. The ones the
    18
    19
         Court has --
04:24 20
                  THE COURT: So --
    21
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: May I?
    22
                  THE COURT: Go ahead.
    23
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: So this is Mr. Campbell in both 1601,
    24
         -03 and -04. He would testify when they were little they had
    25
         their pictures taken together. This is him, this is his
```

```
1
         sister.
                 He recalls this event. He was -- I don't know if you
         call it an usher at that age, a ring bearer, maybe at a
     2
         wedding. She was with him. He does recall that one.
     3
                  1601-21 just relates to Krystle's work, working at the
     4
     5
         food service, he would testify what she did at work. This
         relates to he knows she was a bridesmaid -- 1601-23 that she
         was a bridesmaid many times, and he knows what wedding that is
     7
         that she attended.
                  THE COURT: Was he there?
04:25 10
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: I didn't ask him if he was there. I
    11
         cannot recall. I just asked him if he knows what this event
    12
         was and he recalled the wedding of a particular person.
    13
                  1601-08, he calls this is a picture taken on Spectacle
    14
         Island for an event that Krystle did the wedding planning for.
         This is Jasper White's nephew's -- it's the White wedding. And
    15
         she was also a bridesmaid.
    16
                  THE COURT: Okay. I think this one is unnecessary.
    17
                  MS. CONRAD: 1601-23?
    18
    19
                  THE COURT: Yes, thank you. I think all the others
04:26 20
         would meet my criteria of having some information beyond just
         the emotion. So take out 23.
    21
    22
                  (In open court:)
    23
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: Mr. Bruemmer, if I may start first
         with 1601-03.
    24
    25
                  THE COURT: So these are admitted as a group pursuant
```

```
to the discussion, so they'll be displayed.
     1
     2
                   (Government Exhibit Nos. 1601, 1601-03, 1601-04,
     3
         1601-15, 1601-17, 1601-19, 1601-21, 1601-24 and 1601-28,
         received into evidence.)
     5
         BY MS. PELLEGRINI:
         Q. Mr. Campbell, do you see on the screen before you a
     7
         photograph? Do you recognize who's in the photo?
                  THE COURT: Do you have it?
                  THE JURORS: No.
04:27 10
                  THE COURT: Hang on. The jury didn't get it. Yes?
    11
         Okay.
    12
                  THE WITNESS: Yes, I do.
    13
         BY MS. PELLEGRINI:
    14
            And who's in that photo?
    15
         Α.
             Me and my sister.
            And do you recall the circumstances under which this was
    16
         taken, and why this was taken?
    17
    18
              Probably like a family photo or something like that, just
         Α.
         from when we were little.
    19
04:27 20
         Q.
             Did you often have family photos of you and your sister
    21
         together?
    22
         Α.
             Especially when we were younger, yeah.
    23
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: May I have 1601-04, please.
    24
         Q.
             Do you recognize this photo, Mr. Campbell?
    25
         Α.
              I do.
```

- 1 Q. And what is this?
- 2 A. I believe I was in a wedding with my sister or something
- 3 like that. I mean, obviously I'm not -- do you know what I
- 4 | mean? We're at a wedding.
- 5 0. All right. And so you're the little boy in the --
- 6 A. That has his finger in his mouth, it looks like, yeah.
- 7 (Laughter.)
- 8 Q. Yeah, the finger in your mouth. And that's Krystle next
- 9 to you?
- 04:28 10 A. It is.
  - MS. PELLEGRINI: 1601-15, please.
  - 12 Q. Do you recall the occasion where this photo was taken?
  - 13 A. Yes. It was my parents' 25th wedding anniversary.
  - 14 Q. And what do you recall about that particular occasion?
  - 15 A. It was a surprise party that my sister threw for them.
  - 16 Q. How did she do that?
  - 17 A. She just knew how to do things. She called friends and
  - 18 | family from all around. My biggest job was just not to tell
  - 19 them.
- 04:28 20 (Laughter.)
  - 21 Q. And so just for the record, you're in the picture to my
  - 22 right, and mom and dad in the middle, and Krystle on the end?
  - 23 A. Yes.
  - MS. PELLEGRINI: 1601-17, please.
  - 25 Q. Mr. Campbell, do you remember when this was taken?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. When was this?
- 3 A. This was the last Thanksgiving with my grandfather.
- 4 Q. And your grandfather is the gentleman in the middle
- 5 | wearing the red shirt?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Actually, do you know what? The screen is interactive.
- 8 If you touch it, you can draw a circle on it.
- 9 A. Around my grandfather?
- 04:29 10 Q. Uh-huh.
  - 11 A. Okay. Gotcha.
  - 12 Q. And you said this was the last Thanksgiving?
  - 13 A. Yeah.
  - 14 Q. All right. And so Krystle is behind your grandfather. Is
  - 15 that correct?
  - 16 A. Yes.
  - 17 Q. And your mom and dad are where?
  - 18 A. My mom's right behind me over on the right.
  - 19 Q. Okay. So this is you right here. Actually, you have to
- 04:29 20 do it for me.
  - 21 A. Oh, okay. So that's me, my mom.
  - 22 Q. All right. And dad?
  - 23 A. Dad is right here.
  - 24 Q. Who are the other folks in the picture?
  - 25 A. That's my uncle right there, and my other uncle, my cousin

- 1 Lillian, my Nana, Aunt Cheryl, Aunt Betty, my cousin Linda.
- 2 Q. You have to keep your voice up, Mr. Campbell.
- 3 A. And my cousin Linda. I'm sorry. My Aunt Cheryl, my Aunt
- 4 Betty. I don't know if you caught that.
- 5 Q. Okay. We'll clear that one.
- 6 MS. PELLEGRINI: And 1601-19.
- 7 Q. Who's this in this picture?
- 8 A. That's my sister and my son.
- 9 Q. All right. And how old is your son in here?
- 04:30 10 A. I believe he -- I think he was four. It might actually be
  - on his fourth birthday, if I'm not mistaken.
  - 12 Q. Do you know where this photo was taken?
  - 13 A. I want to say probably 2012.
  - 14 Q. And do you know where it was taken?
  - 15 A. My parents' backyard.
  - MS. PELLEGRINI: 1601-24.
  - 17 Q. Who's this?
  - 18 A. Me and my sister.
  - 19 Q. Okay. I have to say, you have kind of a look on your
- 04:30 20 face.
  - 21 A. Yeah.
  - 22 Q. What was that for?
  - 23 A. I may have been drinking.
  - 24 (Laughter.)
  - 25 MS. PELLEGRINI: 1601-21.

- 1 Q. Do you know where this is?
- 2 A. I'm not exactly sure the location but I believe it's a
- 3 promotion for the Summer Shack, a restaurant she worked at,
- 4 which she was showing the type of food they serve in their
- 5 restaurants.
- 6 MS. PELLEGRINI: And 1601-28.
- 7 Q. Do you know the occasion that this photo was taken?
- 8 A. It was a wedding.
- 9 Q. And do you know where that wedding was held?
- 04:31 10 A. I believe it was Spectacle Island.
  - 11 Q. And whose wedding was it?
  - 12 A. My sister's boss's nephew's wedding on Spectacle Island.
  - 13 Q. Okay. And what role did Krystle have in the wedding?
  - 14 A. She was the best man/bridesmaid. I don't know how that
  - 15 works. But she was the best man, but she was the best man but
  - 16 | she's a girl, so it's a brides -- I don't know. I'm trying to
  - 17 explain it. But, yeah, that's the role she played.
  - 18 (Laughter.)
  - 19 Q. And did she participate in the wedding taking place and
- 04:32 20 putting the wedding together, if you know?
  - 21 A. I'm not 100 percent sure but I think so, yeah.
  - 22 Q. Mr. Campbell, what do you miss about Krystle the most?
  - 23 A. Just being able to talk to her. I mean, it's that simple.
  - 24 Just the simple phone call just to see how she was. You have
  - 25 to get used to a whole new lifestyle. This is somebody you

```
1
         talked to every day. And regardless, it was like, "Hey, what
     2
         are you doing?" "Absolutely nothing," but just, "What's up?"
         you know, and that's how it was. Just like hanging out. Like,
     3
         "What are you doing?" You got a day off, "You want to grab a
     4
     5
         drink?" "You want to go somewhere?" Like, you just realize
         you can't make that phone call anymore, you can't make plans to
     7
         see each other. You know, you grow up with somebody your
         entire life and you just always expect them to be there and now
     8
         they're gone.
04:32 10
             It's been two years. Has it gotten any easier?
         A. I mean, it's gotten -- not really. I guess. I don't
    11
    12
         know. It's different. It's -- maybe you just kind of accept
    13
         it a little bit more, but it's still the same. There are still
    14
         times you just want to talk. And that's somebody that
    15
         understood you, you know. I mean, how you grew up, every
         aspect about you. You didn't have to overly explain how you
    16
         were feeling; you could just say a couple of words and she
    17
         already got what you were going through without having to
    18
    19
         overexplain. It was just easier.
04:33 20
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: Thank you. I have no further
    21
         questions.
    22
                  MS. CLARKE: Thank you very much. No questions.
    23
                  THE WITNESS: I'm all set?
    24
                  THE COURT: All right, sir. Thank you. You may step
    25
         down.
```

```
1
                   (The witness is excused.)
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: William Campbell, Sr. [Sic]
     2
                       WILLIAM A. CAMPBELL, JR., duly sworn
     3
                   THE CLERK: State your name and spell your last name
     4
     5
         for the record, keep your voice up and speak into the mic so
     6
         everyone can hear you.
     7
                   THE WITNESS: My name is William A. Campbell, Jr.,
     8
         C-A-M-P-B-E-L-L.
     9
                                 DIRECT EXAMINATION
04:34 10
         BY MS. PELLEGRINI:
    11
             Good afternoon, Mr. Campbell.
    12
             Good afternoon.
         Α.
    13
              Mr. Campbell, can you tell us what town you live in?
         Ο.
    14
         Α.
              Medford, Massachusetts.
    15
         Q.
              And who do you live with?
             I live with my wife, my son.
    16
         Α.
              And what's your wife's name?
    17
         Q.
              Patricia.
    18
         Α.
    19
         Q.
              And I got into trouble the last time I asked this, but how
04:35 20
         long have you been married?
    21
              Thirty-six years.
         Α.
    22
         Q.
              And tell us about your family.
              We're very close. We've always been close. We've been
    23
    24
         like that since me and Patty got married. We decided to have a
    25
         family two, three years, after being married, and we did so.
```

- 1 We're pretty close. We do a lot of things together.
- 2 Q. And you were the father of Krystle Campbell, correct?
- 3 A. Yes, I am.
- 4 Q. All right. Tell us what Krystle was like.
- 5 A. Krystle was the light of my life, Billy's life. She was
- 6 extremely smart, hard-working, beautiful. Every father's
- 7 dream.
- 8 Q. Did you have a nickname for her?
- 9 A. I miss her a lot.
- 04:36 10 Q. I'm sorry. Did you have a nickname for her?
  - 11 A. Yeah.
  - 12 Q. What was that?
  - 13 A. Her name was "Princess." I never called her "Krystle"
  - 14 unless she did something wrong or something like that, then I'd
  - 15 | call her "Krystle Marie," and then she knew I was angry or
  - 16 something. I always called her "Princess."
  - 17 (Laughter.)
  - 18 Q. Why?
  - 19 A. That's what she was the day she was born.
- 04:36 20 Q. What was it like being her dad?
  - 21 A. She was really something. She was always willing to do
  - 22 anything for anybody. I mean, she wouldn't hesitate. She just
  - 23 had that way of her. I mean, if you needed a shirt, she'd give
  - 24 you hers. She was just always out there. She was just a
  - 25 perfect young lady. I was very lucky.

- Q. Now, when she was growing up, what did she like to do?
- 2 A. Oh, God. Well, she wasn't really a girly girl, okay? I
- 3 | wouldn't ever call her that. But she loved to white-water, she
- 4 used to love to camp, she liked to play baseball, and she had a
- 5 good arm on her. She had a good bat. I was very proud of her.
- 6 Q. And how about family activities? Anything you guys would
- 7 do together?

- 8 A. Oh, all kinds, yeah. Yeah. Anything. That's what I
- 9 meant before. Because I wouldn't know what she was going to
- 04:37 10 come over with the next day because she had a day off, it was
  - 11 like, "Mom, come on. Let's go. We've got to do this. Come
  - 12 on, just give it a shot." I mean, she even jumped out of an
  - 13 airplane. But I just asked her not to tell her mom until she
  - 14 | did it and came home, you know?
  - But we did all kinds of things together. We were lucky
  - 16 enough to have a pool that I built in the backyard. All of us
  - 17 | built it together, actually. Put it together. And we had some
  - 18 great times together.
  - 19 Q. Mr. Campbell, what about your relationship, you and
- 04:38 20 Krystle, just the two of you?
  - 21 A. I just loved her to death. She -- she -- I just loved her
  - 22 to death because she always made me happy. You know, I had
  - 23 troubles with my back and stuff and she would get me out of
  - 24 bed, get me moving, you know. And I thought that was a pretty
  - 25 cool talent because I was just about ready to give up. And

- 1 she'd come over 7:30 in the morning, "Come on dad. Get up. Do
- 2 your exercise. Let's go." And I ended up all right, so...
- Q. Now, when she got older, how often did you two talk?
- A A. Oh, God. Every day she'd call me.
- 5 Q. Why would she call you every day?
- 6 A. Every day. Every single day because -- well, we had
- 7 Rocky. She'd drop him off at four o'clock, five o'clock, six
- 8 o'clock in the morning, and she would have to come back and
- 9 pick up Rocky later in the night, because she loved dogs.
- 04:39 10 Q. I was just going to ask you who Rocky was.
  - 11 A. Yeah, Rocky is her dog. And we'd baby-sit for Rocky. So,
  - 12 you know, we got to see her every single day, twice a day. And
  - 13 we were a really, really close family. Very close family.
  - 14 Q. How about with other members of your family, grandparents,
  - 15 aunts and uncles?
  - 16 A. Yeah, well, when my mom got sick, really sick, Krystle was
  - 17 just about ready to move out on another adventure. And when
  - 18 | she found out that Nana was sick, she moved right in with Nana.
  - 19 Never hesitated, nothing. She just moved right in to take care
- 04:39 20 of my mother.
  - 21 Q. And was she still working at the time?
  - 22 A. Yeah.
  - 23 O. So how did she do both?
  - 24 A. She did it. She had breakfast with her at six o'clock,
  - 25 she'd call her in the afternoon, she'd come home and spend the

```
nights with her. I don't know how she did it. I really don't.
     1
              How about Krystle's relationship with your wife, Patricia?
     2
              Oh, that was special. It wasn't like every mother and
     3
         daughter type. They were like good buddies. I mean, when
     5
         she'd tell me, you know, Krystle asked her to go out with her
         girlfriend or something like that, I would just say, "Yeah,
     7
         yeah, you know, go ahead," because I knew when Patty would come
     8
         home, she'd be all happy and excited. And, you know, that's
         what Krystle did for her mother, you know? They were like best
04:40 10
         of friends. They laughed, they joked. It was amazing to see,
    11
         you know?
    12
              How about her work? What did she do for work and how did
    13
         she do it?
    14
              Her work ethics was unbelievable. She wouldn't think
         anything of working 10, 12 hours a day or more. I mean, she
    15
         just never ran out of gas. And yet like I said, she
    16
    17
         would -- she would work a 12-hour day and then if somebody
    18
         needed something or wanted something or whatever, she would
    19
         just be right there. She would just be right there for them.
04:41 20
              Did you ever get to see her interacting with her coworkers
    21
         or people that she managed?
    22
         Α.
              Oh, yeah.
    23
         Ο.
              Yeah?
```

25

Α.

Q.

Oh, yeah.

What was that like?

- 1 A. Well, it was funny because I kept telling her that, you
- 2 know, she couldn't be a boss and be friends too, like you had
- 3 to be one or the other. But she proved me wrong on that
- 4 because, you know, somebody needed help and they were at the
- 5 lower end of the train, she would go in there and help them and
- 6 then go right on with what she'd have to do. Her coworkers
- 7 loved her.
- 8 Q. How about Krystle with other children?
- 9 A. She had a knack with kids. She had a knack with kids.
- 04:42 10 0. Did she have that all her life?
  - 11 A. Yeah, she -- she -- I don't know. That and animals.
  - 12 Young kids and animals. She had a natural knack.
  - 13 Q. Do you remember anything in particular about her
  - 14 relationship with kids who might have troubles in their lives?
  - 15 A. Well, she had a great relationship with my grandson, and
  - 16 that was every Saturday. And he looked forward to that. He
  - 17 knew Aunty was coming on Saturday morning. And if it was past
  - 18 | nine o'clock he actually asked, "Where's Aunty? Where's
  - 19 Aunty?" And he was only four. So the bond that he had with
- 04:42 20 Aunty was very special.
  - 21 Q. How about keeping in touch with the wider family group?
  - 22 Who did that?
  - 23 A. She would. Krystle did that.
  - 24 Q. How did she do it?
  - 25 A. She made phone calls, she asked everybody when they're

coming down. Aunt Betty lived in New Hampshire, Aunt Lillian lived in Philadelphia. When's the next time we were going to meet, and then she would plan something. And she was -- she drived [sic] by that. She'd get everybody together and pull it off. Have you been able to keep that up?

1

2

3

5

7

04:43 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

25

04:44 20

- No. No. Nobody could fill that boot now. My sister's moved down to Philadelphia. And it hasn't been the same, no.
  - Mr. Campbell, I'm going to ask you about Marathon Monday of 2013 and ask you when you found out what had happened to Krystle.
  - That was a real bad day. I was home watching the marathon and I saw what had happened, the explosion, and I didn't feel right. And my son called me because we really didn't know where she was, whether she was there or at the Red Sox game yet. We didn't know yet. So we waited ten to 12 hours and were talking to the doctors and they were saying they may have to cut off her leg and do things like that, and we said, "Go ahead. You do what you got to do. Just save my baby," you know?

And then the doctor asked me to take a walk with him and take a look and see her. I walked through the door, and it wasn't Krystle. And I passed out on the floor. I couldn't remember anything after that till I woke up about five minutes later and I realized that Krystle was gone and they had made a

```
1
         mistake.
              What's it been like since Krystle is gone?
     2
              Horrible. It's one of the toughest things I think any
     3
         Α.
         parent goes through, but I would never wish it on any parent or
     5
         any person. It's very hard. She was the light of my life.
         I'm proud of her. She was strong, beautiful, smart, giving. I
     7
         miss her.
         Q. Mr. Campbell, before coming into court today, did you and
     8
         I look over some photographs that your family had supplied?
04:45 10
         Α.
             Yeah.
         Q. And do you recognize as you looked at these photographs
    11
         the people who are in them, family members and Krystle?
    12
    13
         Α.
             Yeah.
    14
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: Your Honor, the government would
         offer 1601-01, -02, -07, -08, -09, -14 -- I'm sorry -- -12 and
    15
         -14.
    16
                  MS. CLARKE: No objection.
    17
                  THE COURT: No objection? Okay. Then those several
    18
    19
         exhibits are admitted.
                  (Government Exhibit Nos. 1601-01, 1601-02, 1601-07,
04:46 20
         1601-08, 1601-09, 1601-12, 1601-14, received into evidence.)
    21
    22
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: Thank you.
         BY MS. PELLEGRINI:
    23
```

Q. Mr. Campbell, we're going to put up on the screen in front

25 of you --

```
1
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: Can we start, Mr. Bruemmer, first,
     2
         with 1601-01.
              Mr. Campbell, do you remember this?
     3
             Yeah, that was her first birthday. She was a Cabbage
     4
     5
         Patch. It was when we lived in a small place in Somerville.
         But she even had a big smile at that age.
     7
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: And go to 1601-02, please.
     8
              Who's this?
         Q.
             That's mom and Krystle.
04:46 10
         Q.
             And this is Patricia and Krystle?
    11
         A. Yeah, both of them had their pajammies on together.
    12
                   (Laughter.)
    13
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: 1601-07, please.
    14
         Q.
              Do you remember this day?
              Yeah, that's her First Holy Communion.
    15
         Α.
             And where did this take place? Where is St. Joseph's?
    16
         Q.
             St. Joe's in Medford.
    17
    18
             And so who else is in the photo? Who else is in the
         Q.
    19
         photo?
04:47 20
              Oh, my God. We've got her nephew, me, Pat, and I
    21
         think -- I don't know who that other little guy is.
    22
                   (Laughter.)
    23
              Christopher. Billy, yeah.
         Α.
    24
         Q. How about 1601-08? Now, you said she wasn't a girly girl.
    25
                   (Laughter.)
```

- 1 A. Yeah.
- 2 Q. So what's happening here?
- 3 A. Well, that's when she -- that's when she was a girly girl.
- 4 (Laughter.)
- 5 A. But she loved it. She liked to tap. She -- but she gave
- 6 it up for a baseball bat.
- 7 Q. All right.
- MS. PELLEGRINI: Let's go to 1601-14. -14? Or it
- 9 might be -19. We'll stay with that one for a second.
- 04:48 10 Q. How about this photo, Mr. Campbell? Do you remember this
  - 11 one?
  - 12 A. Yeah, it was her prom.
  - 13 Q. Her prom?
  - 14 A. Yeah.
  - 15 Q. Did she go to many?
  - 16 A. Actually, she -- yeah, she went to a couple. She was very
  - 17 lucky, yeah.
  - 18 Q. Yeah?
  - 19 A. Yeah.
- 04:49 20 Q. And as a matter of fact, how about her circle of friends?
  - 21 A. She -- like I said, she just -- she was a very lucky young
  - 22 | lady. She had girlfriends, boyfriends. I mean, not in the
  - 23 | idea of a boy, but as friends. I mean, she had a lot of
  - 24 friends because she would always -- she liked to do things. I
  - 25 mean, she wouldn't sit around. And, you know, she was always

- outgoing and would have a plan, and that's why people really liked her.
- 3 Q. Mr. Campbell, we talked to your son about a wedding that
- 4 Krystle put together on Spectacle Island for Jasper White's
- 5 nephew. Do you remember that?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. And do you remember what Krystle had to do for the next
- 8 day?
- 9 A. Yeah. It was -- well, she got kind of angry because she
- 04:50 10 | wasn't just a maid of honor for that either; she was running
  - 11 the wedding. She was maid of honor, but yet the boss had put
  - 12 up another event for five o'clock that following day and he let
  - 13 her know, like, at ten or eleven o'clock that night. So she
  - 14 ended up sleeping at the ranger station, but she still did it.
  - 15 And that's just the way she was. I mean, sleeping at a
  - 16 ranger's station so that she didn't miss it. A lobster event?
  - 17 I don't know. But that was Krystle.
  - 18 MS. PELLEGRINI: 1601-10.
  - 19 Q. All right. So we went from the girly girl?
- 04:50 20 A. Yeah. That's when she played baseball. That's before she
  - 21 switched to softball. She played hardball, and that was -- she
  - 22 had a good talent, exceptional talent.
  - 23 MS. PELLEGRINI: And 1601-09.
  - 24 Q. Now, you mentioned you had a pool?
  - 25 A. Yeah.

```
1
              Is that your pool in the backyard?
              That's the one we built, yeah.
     2
         Α.
              Yeah? And is that Krystle in the middle of the picture?
     3
         Q.
              Yeah. Well, there's no room in the cooler, so Krystle
     4
         Α.
     5
         figured keep the watermelon cool by throwing it in the pool, so
         that's what we did. It was a good idea.
     7
                   (Laughter.)
     8
              Mr. Campbell, what do you miss the most about Krystle?
         Q.
              I miss my hug every day. She never left the house without
04:51 10
         giving me a hug. I miss that the most. I miss her being here.
    11
         But I miss the hug.
    12
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: Thank you, Mr. Campbell. I have no
    13
         further questions.
    14
                  MS. CLARKE: Thank you very much.
    15
                  THE WITNESS: Thank you.
                  THE COURT: Thank you, sir. You may step down.
    16
                                                                    Thank
    17
         you.
    18
                   (The witness is excused.)
    19
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: Your Honor, before I leave, I think I
04:52 20
         had misspoken about one of the numbers. I thought it was -14,
         but it was that one 1601-10, and I would ask that that be
    21
    22
         entered appropriately.
    23
                  THE COURT: Strike -14 and put in -10?
    24
                  MS. PELLEGRINI: -10. Yes, sir.
                  THE COURT: Okay.
    25
```

```
(Government Exhibit No. 1601-10, replacing Exhibit No.
     1
         1601-14, received into evidence.)
     2
     3
                  MS. PELLEGRINI:
                                    Thank you.
                  MR. MELLIN: The United States calls Nicole Gross.
     4
     5
                             NICOLE GROSS, duly sworn
     6
                   THE CLERK: State your name and spell your last name
     7
         for the record, keep your voice up and speak into the mic so
         everyone can hear you.
     8
                  THE WITNESS: Nicole Gross, G-R-O-S-S.
04:53 10
                                DIRECT EXAMINATION
    11
         BY MR. MELLIN:
    12
              Good afternoon, Ms. Gross. Where did you grow up?
    13
             Bowie, Maryland.
         Α.
    14
             When you were growing up, did you play any particular
    15
         sports?
              I started swimming competitively at the age of eight.
    16
              And at some point based on your swimming ability did you
    17
         go to the University of Tennessee?
    18
    19
         Α.
              I did.
04:53 20
         Q.
              And did you swim at Tennessee?
    21
         A. I did.
    22
              And while you were at Tennessee, did you meet somebody
    23
         named Michael Gross?
         A. I did.
    24
    25
         Q.
              And if you could just move a little closer to the
```

- 1 | microphone, maybe, or pull it closer to you. And who is
- 2 Michael Gross?
- 3 A. He was at the time a swimmer on the men's swimming and
- 4 diving team at the University of Tennessee, became my
- 5 boyfriend, fiancé, and now husband.
- 6 Q. When were you all married?
- 7 A. 2006.
- $8 \mid Q$ . Who was a better swimmer?
- 9 A. He was, but he didn't have to work as hard as I did.
- 04:54 10 Q. At some point did the two of you move to Charlotte, North
  - 11 | Carolina?
  - 12 A. Yes, we moved shortly after graduating.
  - 13 Q. And were you a personal trainer as well as a kind of
  - 14 triathlete coach?
  - 15 A. Yes, and also running.
  - 16 Q. Taking you to April of 2013, did you attend the Boston
  - 17 | Marathon?
  - 18 A. I did.
  - 19 Q. And how was it that you came to Boston, or why did you
- 04:54 20 | come to Boston that year?
  - 21 A. It was the very first time that I'd ever come to Boston.
  - 22 | I've had a few athletes compete and qualify but I didn't get
  - 23 the chance to go until 2012 when it was a Christmas gift from
  - 24 my mom's husband. And I was my mom's coach to help her qualify
  - 25 for the Boston Marathon.

- Q. Who in addition to you came up to Boston in April of 2013?
- 2 A. I flew up from Charlotte with my husband Michael, and my
- 3 sister Erica, and my mom came down from Baltimore.
- 4 Q. Taking you to the April 15th of 2013, at some point did
- 5 your group go to the marathon?
- 6 A. Yes, we had to -- my mom had booked us a hotel in
- 7 Framingham, so -- she also rented a car. So Michael drove us
- 8 to the airport because my mom had booked us a five o'clock
- 9 flight that day. So logistically, we were trying to make sure
- 04:55 10 that it was going to be easy for her to finish the race and get
  - 11 to the airport in time.

- So that day, after dropping the car off, we took the T to
- 13 Newbury Street. And since the three of us had never been, we
- just used the day to sort of travel around, took some pictures
- by the water and had lunch on Newbury Street and eventually
- 16 just waited for some of our athletes that we knew from where we
- 17 | worked and that I coached to see if we could catch them running
- 18 up towards Hereford and onto Boylston Street.
- 19 Q. When you say the three of you, who are you talking about?
- 04:55 20 A. Michael, Erica and myself.
  - 21 Q. And then at some point did you get down towards the finish
  - 22 line?
  - 23 A. Yes; we stopped at the 26-mile mark. I wanted to stop and
  - 24 | honor the Newtown memorial that they had placed there. So I
  - 25 sat there and took a couple of pictures, and my sister and I

- 1 | were able to get up close to the guardrails and we were able to
- 2 just watch all the runners run by with a very clear picture.
- 3 And we stood there for about 45 minutes and --
- 4 Q. If I can just stop you there.
- 5 MR. MELLIN: If I could have Exhibit 1594 brought up.
- 6 Q. And, Ms. Gross, do you see Exhibit 1594?
- 7 A. I do.
- 8 Q. As you look at it, do you see yourself in that photograph?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 04:56 10 Q. If you could do us a favor and just circle yourself.
  - 11 A. (Witness complies.)
  - 12 Q. And for the record, you're the woman whose face is below
  - 13 the red and blue flag in the middle?
  - 14 A. Yes.
  - 15 Q. In this photo can you see your husband?
  - 16 A. No, I can't. He had stepped back a few feet to start
  - 17 taking some pictures at a better angle for my mom as she was
  - preparing to cross the finish line, so I'm looking back at him.
  - 19 Q. And at that point where's your sister, Erica?
- 04:57 20 A. She's hidden behind the flag right next to me.
  - 21 Q. So as you look at this photo, she would be on your right?
  - 22 A. Correct.
  - 23 Q. The photo on the left, but -- I'm sorry -- on your right?
  - 24 A. Correct.
  - 25 Q. And if I could just have you look --

```
1
                  MR. MELLIN: And just the witness, please, Exhibit
         1619.
     2
              And as you look at that photograph, Ms. Gross, do you
         Q.
         recognize who's in the photograph?
     5
         Α.
              I do.
         Q.
             Who do you see in the photo?
     7
             My husband Michael.
         Α.
     8
              Okay. Do you see your sister?
         Q.
            I see her jacket.
04:58 10
         Q.
              Is this a fair and accurate photo of the finish line
    11
         on Boston -- in Boston on April the 15th, 2013?
    12
         Α.
              Correct.
    13
                  MR. MELLIN: Your Honor, we would move that into
    14
         evidence, Exhibit 1619, and ask to publish.
    15
                  MS. CLARKE: Subject to the earlier objection.
                  THE COURT: All right. Admitted.
    16
                   (Government Exhibit No. 1619 received into evidence.)
    17
         BY MR. MELLIN:
    18
    19
              And, Mrs. Gross, you said that you see your husband
04:58 20
         Michael. Can you circle where he is in this photo?
    21
              (Witness complies.)
         Α.
    22
         Q.
             For the record, it's the man with the black knit cap to
    23
         the right of the center of the photo?
    24
         Α.
            Correct.
```

All right. And if I could just zoom in on that portion.

25

Q.

- 1 I just zoomed in on that portion. The part that is now zoomed
- 2 in, do you see your sister?
- 3 A. I see her jacket.
- 4 Q. Okay. And where is her jacket in this zoomed-in portion?
- 5 A. Do you want me to draw?
- 6 Q. Yes, if you don't mind. Thanks.
- 7 A. (Witness complies.)
- 8 Q. And for the record, you circled the light blue with a
- 9 little bit of a darker blue sleeve on the jacket. Is that
- 04:59 10 | correct?
  - 11 A. Correct.
  - 12 Q. Do you see yourself in this photo at all?
  - 13 A. I do.
  - 14 Q. Okay. Where are you?
  - 15 A. (Indicating.)
  - 16 Q. And, again, for the record, you're the woman with blonde
  - 17 hair. Not the woman in the front but right behind her. Is
  - 18 that right?
  - 19 A. Correct.
- 04:59 20 Q. And let me ask you, did you recognize anyone wearing this
  - 21 black cap right here?
  - 22 A. Unfortunately, no.
  - 23 Q. Okay. Do you recall ever seeing that person that day?
  - 24 A. Unfortunately, no.
  - 25 Q. Thank you.

1 MR. MELLIN: Thank you, Mr. Bruemmer.

- Q. At some point did you and Erica move from this area that was shown in that photo where you're kind of towards the back towards more to the front?
- A. We moved just a few steps closer. My husband had moved a few feet behind us, and it was as if we were at a concert trying to push our way through towards the closer parts to the front. And as two people moved away, I had seen an opening to kind of move us forward.
- 05:00 10 Q. Who moved forward?

felt like threads.

2

5

7

8

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

05:00 20

- 11 A. My sister was standing right in front of me, and I had my
  12 hands on her back.
- 13 Q. Shortly after that, what happened?
  - A. I pushed her forward as I was saying "1, 2, 3, ready, go," and as I said "go," the bomb exploded. And I remember falling back in slow motion, seeing the flags waving, and completely confused as to why a sound like that would be going off at a finish line as I've been to many. And I fell back. And as I woke up, I was actually -- instead of facing the flags, I was looking down the street and saw nothing. I saw nobody near me. I knew something was wrong as I looked down at my legs, that I knew were once ready to run away from danger, and my right quad
- 25 And I didn't see anybody around me and I thought that for

was blown open. I could feel my shoes just dangling by what

05:02 20

05:02 10

sure there was a second bomb that would go off to destroy everybody that was still alive that may have survived that first explosion. And being so terrified in knowing that I couldn't run for help and I didn't see anybody near me, I just screamed for somebody to save me or hear me. And when I did, I was rescued by first responders who turned my position down so that I could lay down on my back. But right before I did, I looked in the eyes of somebody taking a picture of me, and I remember being so scared and helpless and then angry that someone would be taking a picture at such a destructive time.

And I laid down on my back with my legs propped up because I didn't want to put them down because I didn't know what was left of them. And I kept feeling like I was going in and out. So my first visions was seeing nobody to seeing a camera, laying on my back, a slight turn to my right, and I see my husband standing there.

THE COURT: Could we have --

- Q. Did you call out to your husband or speak to him?
- A. I tried to but I couldn't speak, but it was registering that he was right there. So I was reassured that he was alive because I saw him standing.
- Q. At that time what did you think about yourself?
- A. I knew I was receiving help so I was trying to pay attention to what they were telling me, asking me my name, where I was. So I was trying to stay very calm but I'm sort of

- in this other world of paying attention to seeing my husband
  and calling out that "My husband's right there. My husband's
  right there." And then I look over further to my right and the
  only person I see left that was a clear vision was my sister
  laying down, and her eyes were closed.
- Q. Did you see her injuries at that point?
- 7 A. No, but I saw that she was being taken care of.

So I was not sure what was going to happen to me but I was comforted by the fact that I knew my husband was alive and that I had a glimpse of my sister and that someone was taking care of her. And I knew that if I didn't pay attention to what the first responders were trying to tell me -- I was going in and out.

- Q. Did anyone attach a tourniquet to your legs or anything
- 15 like that?

8

11

12

13

24

05:03 10

- 16 A. They did.
- 17 Q. What happened?
- A. I don't remember anything, I just know what was told to me
  afterwards, that there was a first responder as a fireman and
  as a runner who wrapped tourniquets around my legs. And my
  left leg had been broken and was split off to the left, and he
  put it back in place to be lined up with the rest of my leg.
  And I just remember being picked up and rushed into an
  - 25 Q. If I could --

ambulance.

- 1 MR. MELLIN: Just for the witness, please.
- 2 Q. -- have you look at Exhibit 1620.
- Ms. Gross, do you recognize Exhibit 1620?
- 4 A. I do.
- 5 Q. Who is that that is on the stretcher in that photo?
- 6 A. That's me.
- 7 Q. Okay. And is that April 15th of 2013?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 MR. MELLIN: Your Honor, we would move into evidence
- 05:05 10 Exhibit 1620 and ask to publish it.
  - THE COURT: Subject to the prior objection, which was
  - 12 overruled, it's admitted.
  - 13 (Government Exhibit No. 1620 received into evidence.)
  - 14 BY MR. MELLIN:
  - 15 Q. Ms. Gross, as we look at this, again, for the record, that
  - 16 is you on this stretcher. Is that right?
  - 17 A. Correct.
  - 18 Q. And there's a wrap around your left leg. Is that right?
  - 19 A. Correct.
- 05:05 20 Q. Is there also one around your right leg?
  - 21 A. I believe so. I don't know.
  - 22 Q. You mentioned earlier that you had a problem with a
  - 23 | quadricep that was blow open. Which quadricep was blown open?
  - 24 A. My right.
  - 25 Q. After being put on the stretcher, were you taken to the

- 1 hospital?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 | Q. And when you arrived at the hospital, what happened?
- 4 A. I was completely by myself. My family -- my mom had been
- 5 running and stopped. The cell phone lines were down but I'd
- 6 remembered my husband and my mom's cell phone number and I kept
- 7 asking them to call. I was just worried about everybody else.
- 8 And was rolled into an extra room because there were more
- 9 critical people that needed to be rushed immediately into
- 05:06 10 surgery.
  - So I just laid there asking them to keep calling. And
  - 12 | they gave me pain meds and they wrapped me up because I was
  - 13 freezing. And I just remember laying there completely alone.
  - 14 I was alone in the ambulance, and kept feeling helpless and
  - 15 alone.
  - 16 | Q. You went into surgery that day. Is that right?
  - 17 A. Correct.
  - 18 Q. And how many surgeries have you had?
  - 19 A. Between ten and 11.
- 05:06 20 Q. What was the extent of your injuries?
  - 21 A. My right eardrum was blown open; I broke both the tibula
  - 22 and -- tibia and fibula in my left leg that required a rod to
  - 23 be placed along my tibia; my right ankle was blown open with
  - 24 soft-tissue damage; my right Achilles was three-quarters
  - 25 | severed; and I had complications from a blood-clotting filter

```
that was inserted through my groin that had punctured my vena
     1
         cava and lower bowel that required 20 staples along my abdomen.
     2
              And what happened with your right quad?
     3
              It was blown open close to the femoral artery, but
     4
     5
         thankfully it was not affected.
              At some point did you learn the extent of your sister's
     7
         injuries?
     8
         A. I did.
         Q. And what were those?
05:07 10
                  MS. CLARKE: Objection.
                  THE COURT: Overruled.
    11
    12
                  You may answer. You can answer the question.
    13
                  THE WITNESS: Okay.
    14
              I learned that she lost her leg below the knee.
         BY MR. MELLIN:
    15
             And approximately how many surgeries has she had?
    16
         A. Over 20.
    17
    18
                  MR. MELLIN: If we could have the witness, please,
    19
         look at Exhibit 9.
                  THE COURT: Is this in evidence?
05:08 20
                  MR. MELLIN: Yes, it is, your Honor. All of these are
    21
    22
         in evidence.
         BY MR. MELLIN:
    23
```

Mrs. Gross, as you look at Exhibit 9, do you recognize

24

25

that scene?

- 1 A. Yes, I do.
- 2 Q. And as you look at that photograph, can you see both
- 3 yourself and your husband Michael?
- 4 A. I can see myself right now. I can't see Michael.
- 5 Q. All right. If I enlarge it, can you see yourself?
- 6 A. Yes, I do.
- 7 Q. Can you please draw a circle around you in this
- 8 photograph?
- 9 A. (Witness complies.)
- 05:09 10 Q. And for the record, you're the woman who's on the ground.
  - 11 You can see your right thigh, is that fair to say, in this
  - 12 | photograph?
  - 13 A. Correct.
  - 14 Q. Okay. And your husband is where in this photograph?
  - 15 A. (Witness indicating.)
  - 16 Q. And again for the record, it's a gentleman wearing kind of
  - a black sweat top with his head turned back?
  - 18 A. Correct.
  - 19 Q. Okay. As you look at this photograph, there's blood on
- 05:09 20 your leg. Is that right?
  - 21 A. Yes.
  - 22 Q. And were you able to see if you were bleeding from that
  - 23 quad injury?
  - 24 A. At that point, no. My skin had turned a weird gray color,
  - 25 and I just saw just a blown-open quad.

```
1
                  MR. MELLIN: If I could please have the witness look
     2
         at Exhibit 12.
              As you look at Exhibit 12, do you see yourself in that
         photograph?
     5
         Α.
             Yes.
            Okay. Where are you?
     7
             (Witness indicates.)
         Α.
              And you just circled the woman in the red jacket,
         Q.
         essentially in the center of the photograph?
             Correct.
05:10 10
         Α.
    11
             Do you see your sister in this photograph?
         Q.
    12
         Α.
             Yes.
    13
         Q. Could you please circle her?
    14
         Α.
            (Witness complies.)
    15
              And you just circled the woman who's laying on the ground
         in the light blue jacket. Is that right?
    16
    17
         Α.
              Yes.
    18
                  MR. MELLIN: And then if I could please have Exhibit
    19
         19 brought up?
05:10 20
                  I'm not sure that Exhibit 191 is actually in evidence,
    21
         your Honor.
    22
                  THE COURT: All right.
    23
                  MR. MELLIN: Just for the witness.
         BY MR. MELLIN:
    24
    25
            Mrs. Gross, as you look at Exhibit 19, do you recognize
```

```
1
         anyone in that photograph?
     2
         Α.
              Yes.
     3
              Who do you see in that?
         Q.
             My sister, and I see my leq.
     4
         Α.
     5
         Q.
             All right.
                  MR. MELLIN: Your Honor, I would move into evidence
     7
         Exhibit 19 and ask to publish it.
                  MS. CLARKE: Same objection.
                  THE COURT: All right. Admitted.
                   (Government Exhibit No. 19 received into evidence.)
05:11 10
    11
         BY MR. MELLIN:
              Mrs. Gross, as you look at Exhibit 19, could you please
    12
    13
         circle your sister.
    14
         Α.
             (Witness complies.)
    15
             For the record, you circled the woman in the middle of the
         photograph in a light blue jacket. Is that right?
    16
    17
         Α.
              Yes.
    18
             And you mentioned that in this photo you can also see your
         Q.
    19
         leg. Is that right?
05:11 20
         Α.
             Yes.
    21
            And can you circle where you see your leg?
         Q.
    22
         Α.
             (Witness complies.)
    23
             And you circled the leg next to the man in blue. Is that
    24
         right?
    25
         Α.
             Yes.
```

```
All right. I'm going to try to zoom in on that. Now, do
     1
     2
         you see your leg there?
     3
         Α.
              Yes.
            All right. And then finally, if I could have you look at
     5
         Exhibit 20.
                  MR. MELLIN: Which is in evidence, your Honor.
     7
              Mrs. Gross, do you see your sister in that photograph?
     8
         Α.
              Yes.
              Could you please circle her?
05:12 10
         Α.
             (Witness complies.)
              And for the record, you circled the woman in the light
    11
         blue that's just to the left of the woman in the red. Is that
    12
         right?
    13
    14
         Α.
              Yes.
    15
         Q.
              Okay.
    16
                  MR. MELLIN: With the Court's indulgence.
                  (Pause.)
    17
    18
                  MR. MELLIN: Thank you, your Honor.
    19
                  MS. CLARKE: Thank you. No questions.
05:12 20
                  THE COURT: All right, Mrs. Gross. Thank you. You
    21
         may step down.
    22
                  (The witness is excused.)
    23
                  THE COURT: Let me see counsel at the side.
    24
                  (Discussion at sidebar and out of the hearing of the
    25
         jury:)
```

1 THE COURT: So I was told earlier that that probably is it for the afternoon? 2 MR. WEINREB: Yes. 3 THE COURT: Can you tell us who will be up tomorrow? 4 5 MR. WEINREB: Yes. I think we'll probably begin with 6 the Colliers, Andrew Collier. 7 THE COURT: I don't know if I'm working from the most current list. This is from last week. 8 9 MR. WEINREB: Okay. This may not be -- we were having 05:13 10 to adjust the order for various things, but we'd probably begin 11 with Andrew Collier. And Joe Rogers is Sean Collier's stepfather. And then at that point it's a little flexible. 12 13 Oh, Chief DiFava will also testify about Sean Collier. And 14 then at that point we're flexible, but among the witnesses we intend to call tomorrow were Michelle Gamble, the -- a witness 15 from the United States Marshal's Service who will authenticate 16 the screen shot from the video. 17 18 We may, in lieu of having Ms. Gamble ID -- or 19 authenticate pictures of various victims, streamline it or 05:14 20 simplify it by having one of the victim witness advocates identify all of the photos, but it's just a very quick witness, 21 22 identifying the photos. And then Eric Whalley. Mr. Whalley 23 and Adrianne Haslet-Davis for tomorrow. 24 I think all the others have scheduling issues and they 25 need to testify on Thursday.

1 THE COURT: And -- okay. MS. CONRAD: We would like to be heard maybe after the 2 jury is excused about some issues with respect to the marshals. 3 In particular, we, over the lunch break, asked to inspect the 4 5 camera and inspect the cell block and we were told that -- and also to take a photograph of it because we believe it's reflective. And we were told that according to general counsel 7 8 for the marshals that permission would have to come from the U.S. Attorney's office. I trust that the Court's order will 05:15 10 suffice to allow us to inspect that. 11 THE COURT: Okay. So why don't we do this. I don't know if you've had any negotiations or conversations about 12 13 Why don't we let you see what you can accomplish 14 together, and we can take it up early tomorrow morning if we 15 have to. MS. CONRAD: Well, I'm going to need a chance for 16 someone to take a photograph before the witness testifies, so I 17 18 really need to --19 THE COURT: Yeah, before. 05:16 20 MS. CONRAD: But if we take it up tomorrow morning, I don't know when I'm going to have someone take a photograph and 21 22 when I can inspect it before we actually start because I'm 23 going to be in court. 24 THE COURT: All right. Well, let's -- maybe you can 25 talk about it and we can have a four o'clock session or

```
1
         something.
     2
                  MS. CLARKE: Your Honor, there's also the question of
     3
         the revised photos of the survivors. We've seen --
                  THE COURT: Yeah, I was going to get to that. That's
     4
     5
         why I wanted to know who's coming, because I want the
         government to match the exhibits with those people as the
     7
         sorting has now happened, but so we won't go through it in open
         court.
                  MS. CLARKE: Right. Thank you.
05:16 10
                  THE COURT: I agree with that. Okay.
                  So we'll let them go until tomorrow morning and we'll
    11
    12
         plan to get together at four o'clock? Does that work?
    13
                  (In open court:)
    14
                  THE COURT: Jurors, for your purposes, that's it for
         today. Witness scheduling issues mostly. We'll continue
    15
         tomorrow on the usual schedule at nine o'clock and proceed with
    16
    17
         the evidence.
    18
                  And again, please, no conversation about the case
    19
         among yourselves or with anyone else, and avoid any media
05:17 20
         reports.
                  Have a pleasant evening, and we'll see you tomorrow
    21
    22
         morning at nine o'clock.
    23
                  THE CLERK: All rise for the Court and the jury. The
         Court will be in recess.
    24
    25
                   (The Court and jury exit the courtroom and the
```

```
proceedings adjourned at 3:19 p.m.)
 1
 2
 3
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

CERTIFICATE I, Marcia G. Patrisso, RMR, CRR, Official Reporter of the United States District Court, do hereby certify that the foregoing transcript constitutes, to the best of my skill and ability, a true and accurate transcription of my stenotype notes taken in the matter of Criminal Action No. 13-10200-GAO, United States of America v. Dzhokhar A. Tsarnaev. /s/ Marcia G. Patrisso MARCIA G. PATRISSO, RMR, CRR Official Court Reporter Date: 12/14/15