

**Sealed Correspondence**

*U.S. v. Tsarnaev*, 13-CR10200-GAO

See Footnote 6 to Dkt. No. 388



U.S. Department of Justice

*Carmen M. Ortiz*  
United States Attorney  
District of Massachusetts

Main Reception: (617) 748-3100

*John Joseph Moakley United States Courthouse*  
1 Courthouse Way  
Suite 9200  
Boston, Massachusetts 02210

May 23, 2014

**BY HAND DELIVERY**

Miriam Conrad, Esq.  
Timothy Watkins, Esq.  
William Fick, Esq.  
Judy Clarke, Esq.  
David Bruck, Esq.  
Federal Defender's Office  
51 Sleeper Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Boston, MA 02210

Re: United States v. Dzhokhar Tsarnaev, Crim. No. 13-10200-GAO

Dear Counsel:

We write to call to your attention a fact of which you may already be aware. It is the government's understanding that Mr. Brendan Garvin, Deputy Clerk to Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler, was present at the Forum Restaurant, 755 Boylston Street, Boston, on April 15, 2013 when the explosive device was detonated in front of the restaurant during the running of the Boston Marathon. Mr. Garvin, like many others in the area, was not injured and will not be a witness in any case. It is the government's understanding that Judge Bowler is aware that Mr. Garvin was at the Forum at the time of the explosion.

As you know, Judge Bowler is the Magistrate Judge who was assigned to *United States v. Tsarnaev*, MJ No. 13-02106-MBB. We call the foregoing fact to your attention only in an abundance of caution, since Deputy Clerks play a non-decisional role in matters in this court.

Sincerely,

CARMEN M. ORTIZ  
United States Attorney

By: /s/Aloke Chakravarty  
Aloke Chakravarty  
William Weinreb  
Nadine Pellegrini  
Assistant U.S. Attorneys

**CLARKE & RICE, APC**  
1010 Second Avenue, Ste. 1800  
San Diego, California 92101  
(619) 308-8484

**FEDERAL PUBLIC DEFENDER OFFICE**  
DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS  
51 Sleeper Street, Fifth Floor  
Boston, Massachusetts 02210  
(617) 223-8061

**DAVID I. BRUCK**  
220 Sydney Lewis Hall  
Lexington, VA 24450  
(540) 458-8188

June 3, 2014

Aloke Chakravarty  
Nadine Pellegrini  
William Weinreb  
Assistant U.S. Attorneys  
United States Courthouse  
1 Courthouse Way, Suite 9200  
Boston, Massachusetts 02210

Re: United States v. Dzhokhar Tsarnaev  
Criminal No. 13-10200- GAO

Dear Counsel:

We were surprised to learn from your May 23, 2014 letter that Magistrate Judge Bowler's Deputy Clerk, Brendan Garvin, was present near the scene of the second explosion at the 2013 Boston Marathon. We are concerned that this information was not disclosed to us until almost 13 months after Mr. Tsarnaev's arrest. The revelation raises questions about whether others working for or closely connected to the prosecution or federal court in Massachusetts were directly affected by or were potential witnesses to, the charged crimes.

Given your unique access to information about the identity and employment of the victims and potential witnesses, we write to ask that you advise us whether any such individuals are employed in your office, the Department of Justice, law enforcement agencies involved in the prosecution of this case, or by the Court, the U.S. Marshal, U.S. Probation or Clerk's Office for the District of Massachusetts, or otherwise employed in one of the federal court houses in the District of Massachusetts. This information is relevant to a potential motion to recuse your offices or the federal court for the District of Massachusetts.

We would appreciate an immediate response.

Sincerely,

*Judy Clarke*

David I. Bruck

Judy Clarke

Miriam Conrad

William Fick

Timothy Watkins

Counsel for Dzhokhar Tsarnaev



**U.S. Department of Justice**

*Carmen M. Ortiz*  
*United States Attorney*  
*District of Massachusetts*

*Main Reception: (617) 748-3100*

*John Joseph Moakley United States Courthouse*  
*1 Courthouse Way*  
*Suite 9200*  
*Boston, Massachusetts 02210*

June 18, 2014

**BY E-MAIL AND HAND DELIVERY**

Miriam Conrad, Esq.  
Timothy Watkins, Esq.  
William Fick, Esq.  
Judy Clarke, Esq.  
David Bruck, Esq.  
Federal Defender's Office  
51 Sleeper Street, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Boston, MA 02210

Re: United States v. Dzhokhar Tsarnaev, Crim. No. 13-10200-GAO

Dear Counsel:

We are writing in response to your letter of June 3, 2014, requesting discovery regarding the identity and employment of victims and potential witnesses for purposes of filing a potential recusal motion. We are aware of our own responsibilities with respect to recusal and we presume that court personnel are aware of theirs. Accordingly, we decline to respond to your discovery request.

Very truly yours,

CARMEN M. ORTIZ  
United States Attorney

By: /s/Nadine Pellegrini  
Nadine Pellegrini  
Aloke Chakravarty  
William Weinreb  
Assistant U.S. Attorneys